

BOBBY SINGLETON, et al

VS

WES ALLEN, et al

SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN

July 29, 2024




ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING®

www.alabamareporting.com * 877.478.3376

Senator Rodger Smitherman

1..4

| | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 1</p> <p>1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 2 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA 3 SOUTHERN DIVISION 4 CASE NUMBER 2:21-CV-1291-AMM 5 BOBBY SINGLETON, et al., 6 Plaintiffs, 7 8 v.  9 WES ALLEN, in his official capacity 10 as Alabama Secretary of State, et al., 11 Defendants. 12 13 CASE NUMBER 2:21-CV-01530-AMM 14 EVAN MILLIGAN, et al., 15 Plaintiffs, 16 17 v. 18 WES ALLEN, in his official capacity 19 as Alabama Secretary of State, et al., 20 Defendants. 21 22 CASE NUMBER 2:21-CV-01536-AMM 23 MARCUS CASTER, et al., Plaintiffs, v. WES ALLEN, in his official capacity as Alabama Secretary of State, et al., Defendants.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">DEPOSITION OF SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN July 29, 2024 9:01 a.m.</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 3</p> <p>1 STIPULATIONS 2 3 IT IS STIPULATED AND AGREED by and 4 between the parties through their respective 5 counsel that the deposition of SENATOR RODGER 6 SMITHERMAN may be taken before Sabrina Lewis, 7 Certified Court Reporter, Notary Public, State of 8 Alabama at Large, at Whatley Kallis, 1000 Park 9 Place Tower, Birmingham, Alabama, on July 29, 10 2024, commencing at 9:01 a.m. 11 12 IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that 13 the signature to and reading of the deposition by 14 the witness is not waived, the deposition to have 15 the same force and effect as if full compliance 16 had been had with all laws and rules of court 17 relating to the taking of depositions. 18 19 IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that 20 it shall not be necessary for any objections to be 21 made by counsel to any questions, except as to 22 form or leading questions, and that counsel for 23 the parties may make objections and assign grounds</p> |
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 2</p> <p>1 The deposition of SENATOR RODGER 2 SMITHERMAN was taken before Sabrina Lewis, CCR, on 3 July 29, 2024, commencing at 9:01 a.m., at Whatley 4 Kallis, 1000 Park Place Tower, Birmingham, 5 Alabama, pursuant to the stipulations set forth 6 herein. 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 4</p> <p>1 at the time of trial, or at the time said 2 deposition is offered in evidence, or prior 3 thereto. 4 5 IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that 6 notice of filing of the deposition by the 7 Commissioner is waived. 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23</p> |



Senator Rodger Smitherman

5..8

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------|-----------------|----|------------------|-----|--------------------|-----|------------------------|------|----------------------------------|----|---------------|--|----|--|----------------------------------|-----|---------------|--|----|--|---------------------------------|-----|---------------------|--|----|--|----|--|----|--|----|--|----|--|
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 5</p> <p>1 A P P E A R A N C E S</p> <p>2</p> <p>3 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE SINGLETON PLAINTIFFS:</p> <p>4 James Uriah Blacksher, Esq.</p> <p>5 James U. Blacksher, Attorney</p> <p>6 825 Linwood Road</p> <p>7 Birmingham, Alabama 35222</p> <p>8 205-612-3752</p> <p>9 jublacksher@gmail.com</p> <p>10</p> <p>11 U.W. Clemon, Esq.</p> <p>12 U.W. Clemon, LLC</p> <p>13 2001 Park Place, Suite 1000</p> <p>14 Birmingham, Alabama 35222</p> <p>15 205-837-2898</p> <p>16 uwclemon1@gmail.com</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 7</p> <p>1 A P P E A R A N C E S (continued)</p> <p>2</p> <p>3 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANTS, STEVE</p> <p>4 LIVINGSTON AND CHRIS PRINGLE:</p> <p>5 Riley Katherine Lancaster, Esq.</p> <p>6 Balch & Bingham</p> <p>7 1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500</p> <p>8 Birmingham, Alabama 35203</p> <p>9 205-226-8767</p> <p>10 rlancaster@balch.com</p> <p>11</p> <p>12 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT, WES ALLEN:</p> <p>13 (via videoconference)</p> <p>14 Misty S. Fairbanks Messick, Esq.</p> <p>15 Assistant Attorney General</p> <p>16 Office of the Attorney General</p> <p>17 State of Alabama</p> <p>18 501 Washington Avenue</p> <p>19 P.O. Box 300152</p> <p>20 Montgomery, Alabama 36130-0152</p> <p>21 334-242-7300</p> <p>22 misty.messick@alabamaag.gov</p> <p>23</p> | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 6</p> <p>1 A P P E A R A N C E S (continued)</p> <p>2</p> <p>3 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE MILLIGAN PLAINTIFFS:</p> <p>4 (via videoconference)</p> <p>5 Kathryn Carden Sadasivan, Esq.</p> <p>6 NAACP Legal Defense & Educational Fund, Inc.</p> <p>7 40 Rector Street, Fifth Floor</p> <p>8 New York, New York 10006</p> <p>9 332-600-9546</p> <p>10 ksadasivan@naacpldf.org</p> <p>11</p> <p>12 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANTS, STEVE</p> <p>13 LIVINGSTON AND CHRIS PRINGLE:</p> <p>14 Dorman Walker, Esq.</p> <p>15 Balch & Bingham LLP</p> <p>16 445 Dexter Avenue, Suite 8000</p> <p>17 P.O. Box 78 (36101)</p> <p>18 Montgomery, Alabama 36104</p> <p>19 334-269-3138</p> <p>20 dwalker@balch.com</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 8</p> <p>1 I N D E X</p> <p>2</p> <p>3 EXAMINATION INDEX</p> <p>4</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>5 WITNESS: SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN</td><td>PAGE</td></tr> <tr> <td>6 BY MR. WALKER</td><td>10</td></tr> <tr> <td>7 BY MS. MESSICK</td><td>178</td></tr> <tr> <td>8 BY MR. BLACKSHER</td><td>194</td></tr> </table> <p>9</p> <p>10 EXHIBIT INDEX</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>10 Defendant's Exhibit</td><td>PAGE</td></tr> <tr> <td>11 1 Document 242-4, "Exhibit 4,</td><td>77</td></tr> <tr> <td>12 2021 Plan"</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>13</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>14 2 Document 242-5, "Exhibit 5,</td><td>101</td></tr> <tr> <td>15 2023 Plan"</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>16</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>17 3 Document 311, "Appendix A,</td><td>125</td></tr> <tr> <td>18 Remedial Plan 3"</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>19</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>20</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>21</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>22</td><td></td></tr> <tr> <td>23</td><td></td></tr> </table> | 5 WITNESS: SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN | PAGE | 6 BY MR. WALKER | 10 | 7 BY MS. MESSICK | 178 | 8 BY MR. BLACKSHER | 194 | 10 Defendant's Exhibit | PAGE | 11 1 Document 242-4, "Exhibit 4, | 77 | 12 2021 Plan" | | 13 | | 14 2 Document 242-5, "Exhibit 5, | 101 | 15 2023 Plan" | | 16 | | 17 3 Document 311, "Appendix A, | 125 | 18 Remedial Plan 3" | | 19 | | 20 | | 21 | | 22 | | 23 | |
| 5 WITNESS: SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN | PAGE | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6 BY MR. WALKER | 10 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 7 BY MS. MESSICK | 178 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8 BY MR. BLACKSHER | 194 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 10 Defendant's Exhibit | PAGE | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11 1 Document 242-4, "Exhibit 4, | 77 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 12 2021 Plan" | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 13 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 14 2 Document 242-5, "Exhibit 5, | 101 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 15 2023 Plan" | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 16 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 17 3 Document 311, "Appendix A, | 125 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 18 Remedial Plan 3" | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 19 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 20 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 23 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |



Senator Rodger Smitherman

9..12

Page 9

1 I, Sabrina Lewis, a Certified Court
 2 Reporter and a Notary Public for the State of
 3 Alabama at Large, acting as Commissioner, certify
 4 that, pursuant to the Alabama Rules of Civil
 5 Procedure and the foregoing stipulation of
 6 counsel, there came before me at Whatley Kallis,
 7 1000 Park Place Tower, Birmingham, Alabama, on
 8 July 29, 2024, commencing at 9:01 a.m., SENATOR
 9 RODGER SMITHERMAN, witness in the above cause, for
 10 oral examination, whereupon the following
 11 proceedings were had:
 12 THE COURT REPORTER: Usual stipulations?
 13 MR. WALKER: Yes, please.
 14 And you have the option, Senator
 15 Smitherman, to read your deposition and maybe make
 16 any corrections that you think need to be made and
 17 sign it. Do you want to read and sign?
 18 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Yes.
 19 MR. WALKER: Okay.
 20 (Witness sworn.)
 21 ///
 22 ///
 23 ///

Page 10

1 SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN,
 2 duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
 3 EXAMINATION
 4 BY MR. WALKER:
 5 Q. Good morning, Senator Smitherman.
 6 A. Good morning, counsel.
 7 Q. Even though we know each other, let me
 8 introduce myself for the record. I'm Dorman
 9 Walker. And as you know, I represent the
 10 redistricting committee and the chairs of the
 11 committee who right now are Representative Pringle
 12 and Senator Livingston, who have intervened in
 13 this case as defendants.
 14 There is also another defendant,
 15 Secretary of State Wes Allen, who's being
 16 represented in this deposition by Misty Fairbanks,
 17 who you saw a moment ago, in the Attorney
 18 General's Office.
 19 This is our opportunity to understand
 20 your testimony in this matter and what you have to
 21 say against the Enacted Plan, the plan that the
 22 legislature passed in 2023, and in favor of
 23 whatever remedy that you and the other plaintiffs

Page 11

1 are seeking from the court in this matter.
 2 You've been deposed a number of times,
 3 have you not?
 4 A. I've been deposed several times but not a
 5 tremendously large number of times.
 6 Q. Well, let's go over the rules, then, real
 7 quickly.
 8 This is not a normal conversation
 9 because our court reporter is taking everything
 10 down.
 11 I have a bad habit when I'm talking with
 12 someone of kind of jumping into the conversation
 13 at times. We can't do that in this conversation.
 14 We have to wait till each one finishes.
 15 And in particular, you also please
 16 answer my questions verbally, with a narrative
 17 answer, a yes, no, or narrative answer instead of
 18 shaking your head or something like that, because
 19 she can't take that down.
 20 A. All right.
 21 Q. If you don't understand the question that
 22 I've asked or if it's wrong in some way, if maybe
 23 I've summarized your testimony and you think maybe

Page 12

1 I misquoted you or said something in the wrong
 2 way, let me know, because I don't want to ask a
 3 question that you don't understand or that you
 4 feel is in some way tricky. And I'll try to
 5 rephrase the way question, okay?
 6 A. Okay.
 7 Q. Similarly, as we go through the
 8 deposition, it's not uncommon that you might
 9 remember something or a thought may occur about
 10 something you could have said to an earlier
 11 question. So if you want to go back and change a
 12 question, if you say, you know, Dorman, I forgot
 13 something. I need to add something to the
 14 question I gave you a while ago -- answer, that's
 15 perfectly fine, okay?
 16 A. Okay.
 17 Q. Your counsel may object from time to
 18 time. He may say, "Object to the form." If he
 19 does that, he's really talking to me and giving me
 20 a sort of legal advice that he doesn't think I
 21 asked a very good question, but you can go ahead
 22 and answer the -- answer the question.
 23 If he thinks I'm getting into privileged

ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 13

1 material, which I don't intend to do, he'll
 2 instruct you not to answer, and we'll take that up
 3 at that time, okay?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. Okay. We'll occasionally take breaks.
 6 You're here for the morning, and I'm going to try
 7 to keep this as short as I can. And what we
 8 normally do is take breaks on the hour. If that's
 9 good with you, that's what we'll do. If you need
 10 to take a break before then, just let me know. As
 11 long as there's not a question pending, we can
 12 take a break.
 13 A. I understand.
 14 Q. Okay.
 15 A. Thank you.
 16 Q. Is there any reason, any medical reason
 17 or medication you've taken or anything like that,
 18 why you can't answer my questions today?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Okay. Thank you.
 21 Would you state your name for the
 22 record, please?
 23 A. Rodger Smitherman.

Page 14

1 Q. And before your involvement in this case
 2 as a plaintiff -- this is the Singleton case, of
 3 course -- have you ever been involved in
 4 litigation before?
 5 A. Yes, I have.
 6 Q. Can you tell me each one of those cases?
 7 A. Well, the one that comes to my mind --
 8 AND when you say litigation, are you referring to
 9 the reapportionment or just general litigation at
 10 all?
 11 Q. Just any lawsuit, yes, sir. Including
 12 reapportionment.
 13 MR. BLACKSHER: As a party or as a
 14 lawyer?
 15 THE WITNESS: Lawyer.
 16 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Well, that's a really
 17 good point. Let's say first as a party.
 18 A. Oh, we -- I recall the last case I think
 19 we had regarding redistricting. And it may have
 20 been addressing the senate and the House plans
 21 where --
 22 Q. Was that the Chestnut case or the ALBC
 23 case?

Page 15

1 A. I'm not sure. I'm not sure.
 2 Q. Okay. That's fine.
 3 A. But I remember the three-judge panel,
 4 which was Judge Pryor, Judge Thompson --
 5 Q. That was -- that was ALBC.
 6 A. -- Myron Thompson.
 7 Q. The Alabama Legislative Black Caucus
 8 case.
 9 A. Yes. I was involved.
 10 Q. That's right.
 11 A. And I actually was a witness --
 12 Q. Uh-huh.
 13 A. -- in that case in the trial itself.
 14 Q. You were.
 15 Any other litigation that you can recall
 16 being involved in?
 17 A. You know, actually, probably a few more
 18 now. I just can't recall them.
 19 Q. I understand.
 20 A. But there's probably one or two others.
 21 Q. Do you recall any litigation that --
 22 redistricting litigation that you've been involved
 23 in as a lawyer?

Page 16

1 A. I can't recall any of them as a lawyer.
 2 Q. Yes.
 3 A. No, I can't recall any of them as a
 4 lawyer.
 5 Q. Have you ever been deposed before today?
 6 You would have been deposed in ALBC. But that
 7 would have been a long time ago.
 8 A. I just can't recall really.
 9 Q. Okay.
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. Do you recall, other than -- you've
 12 testified that you were a witness in ALBC, and I
 13 remember that. Do you recall any other time when
 14 you testified in court?
 15 A. I can't recall any -- I mean, just as a
 16 plaintiff or defendant in a lawsuit or something?
 17 Q. Uh-huh.
 18 A. I can't -- I can't recall.
 19 Q. That's fine. That's fine.
 20 Can I ask you for your residential
 21 address?
 22 A. 224 16th Avenue Southwest, Birmingham,
 23 ZIP code 35211.



Senator Rodger Smitherman

17..20

Page 17

1 Q. And how long have you lived at that
2 address, sir? Roughly?
3 A. Oh, it's roughly 20 years maybe.
4 Twenty-plus years.
5 Q. That will do.
6 A. Maybe a little longer.
7 Q. Do you have any plans to move in the
8 foreseeable future?
9 A. No. I don't have any plans.
10 Q. Let's talk about what you did to prepare
11 for your deposition today. Did you receive or
12 were you shown a notice for your deposition or
13 somehow told that you were going to be deposed
14 today?
15 A. Yeah, I received a copy of the notice of
16 deposition.
17 Q. Okay. When did you receive the notice of
18 deposition?
19 A. Well, the -- I received notice of the
20 deposition, not a copy of it, but I received -- I
21 knew I was going -- I was scheduled for this
22 deposition.
23 Q. Okay.

Page 18

1 A. And I'm just -- I'm not sure the exact
2 date, but it was several -- you know, several
3 weeks ago.
4 Q. Who told you that you were going to be
5 deposed?
6 A. My counsel informed me.
7 Q. Was it in a telephone conversation or by
8 an email?
9 A. It was a telephone conversation.
10 Q. Okay. And which of your counsel informed
11 you?
12 A. Attorney Blacksher.
13 Q. Okay. Was anybody else on the line at
14 that call, do you know?
15 A. I don't -- I'm not for certain.
16 Q. Okay. So far as you know, it was you and
17 Attorney Blacksher?
18 A. Yeah.
19 Q. Okay. Did you meet with anyone in
20 preparation for your deposition?
21 A. Oh, I guess if you call Zoom. I talked
22 to my counsel.
23 Q. Okay. And would that again be

Page 19

1 Mr. Blacksher?
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. Okay. Anyone else?
4 A. I had a conversation -- in that
5 conversation, I talked with co-counsel.
6 Q. Would that be Judge Clemon?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. Okay. Was anybody else on that Zoom
9 call?
10 A. No. Not to my knowledge.
11 Q. I understand. And when was that Zoom
12 call?
13 A. I think it was -- I think it was
14 Thursday -- last -- this past Thursday.
15 Q. Last Thursday? And about how long did
16 that last, sir?
17 A. Thirty minutes to an hour maybe.
18 Q. Okay.
19 A. Somewhere in that range.
20 Q. During that conversation -- and I'm
21 not -- don't tell me what -- what you said to them
22 or what they said to you, but did you look at any
23 documents?

Page 20

1 A. Yes, I looked at some, yes.
2 Q. Do you recall what those documents were?
3 A. Yes. I looked at the -- the maps.
4 Q. Okay.
5 A. And the -- for the districts for the way
6 that the court has them now. I think that's
7 right.
8 Q. Did you --
9 A. And I looked at once again my plan.
10 Q. Uh-huh.
11 A. The Smitherman Plan. And I looked at the
12 Singleton Plan.
13 Q. So did you look at the plan that the
14 legislature passed in 2021?
15 A. I did get a chance to look at it.
16 Q. Okay. And did you look at the plan that
17 the legislature passed in 2023?
18 A. No, wait a minute. Let me back out and
19 say that I didn't look at -- I don't recall
20 looking at 2021.
21 Q. Okay.
22 A. I looked at 2023.
23 Q. All right. Thank you. Did you look at



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 21

Page 23

1 the court-Ordered Plan?
 2 A. Yes, I did.
 3 Q. And you looked, I believe you said, at
 4 the Singleton Plan and the Smitherman Plan?
 5 A. I did.
 6 Q. Any others?
 7 A. No. Not that I recall.
 8 Q. Were there any other documents that you
 9 recall looking at?
 10 A. Looked at the transcript of the last --
 11 of the hearing that we had with the three-panel
 12 judges.
 13 Q. The last PI hearing?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. Okay. Can I ask you, Senator Smitherman,
 16 where you were raised?
 17 A. I was raised in -- to give you a
 18 reference point, I was raised in Montevallo.
 19 Q. Okay. But really outside of Montevallo
 20 or someplace?
 21 A. Yeah, just a little bit outside.
 22 Q. Okay.
 23 A. It was in the county, but, you know, when

1 marketing and insurance. It was somewhat of a --
 2 somewhat of a minor concentration in economics.
 3 And the second one, I was leaning toward
 4 philosophy.
 5 Q. Philosophy?
 6 A. Leaning towards it.
 7 Q. And your schooling after University of
 8 Montevallo?
 9 A. I went to Miles Law School.
 10 Q. Okay. What year did you graduate from
 11 University of Montevallo, if you can recall?
 12 A. I think it was 1976.
 13 Q. And what year did you graduate from
 14 Miles?
 15 A. I can't remember. It was either '86 or
 16 '89, enter in there.
 17 Q. All right.
 18 A. I just can't remember.
 19 Q. That's fine.
 20 A. And it's sitting on my wall.
 21 Q. Are you a member of the Alabama
 22 legislature?
 23 A. Yes, I am.

Page 22

Page 24

1 you -- it was less -- I mean, gosh, you could step
 2 across here, you were in the city, but you step
 3 out here, you were in the county.
 4 Q. I get -- I get it.
 5 Did it have -- was it a crossroads with
 6 a name or just -- just outside Montevallo?
 7 A. No, it was a little community called
 8 Almont.
 9 Q. A-L-M-O-N-T?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. And is that where you grew up to
 12 adulthood or through high school?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Briefly go over your educational
 15 background, if you will, starting when you
 16 graduated from high school.
 17 A. I graduated from Montevallo High School.
 18 Q. Okay.
 19 A. And then attended the University of
 20 Montevallo, where I graduated also.
 21 Q. What was your area of study?
 22 A. Bachelor's of business administration
 23 with a major concentration in management and

1 Q. And would you tell us what district you
 2 represent?
 3 A. Senate District 18.
 4 Q. And what geographic area does senate
 5 District 18 cover?
 6 A. Well, it's in parts of these areas. It
 7 covers Hoover, Mountain Brook, Homewood, Irondale,
 8 Birmingham, and parts of the county like out at
 9 Shannon and Ross Bridges and that part that's in
 10 the county out there.
 11 Q. So all within Jefferson County?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. What's the partisan makeup of the
 14 Jefferson County Delegation?
 15 A. Which? The House?
 16 Q. In the senate?
 17 A. In the senate?
 18 Q. Yes, sir.
 19 A. You mean like -- oh --
 20 Q. How many Democrats and how many
 21 Republicans?
 22 A. It's four Republicans and three
 23 Democrats.



Page 25

1 **Q. Are the Republicans all white?**
 2 A. Yes.
 3 **Q. Are the Democrats all black?**
 4 A. Yes.
 5 **Q. In addition to being a senator for SD-18,**
 6 **do you have any other employment?**
 7 A. Yes. I'm an attorney, practicing
 8 attorney.
 9 **Q. Are you solo or in a firm with some other**
 10 **people?**
 11 A. I practice with my daughter.
 12 **Q. Okay. What's the name of y'all's firm?**
 13 A. Smitherman Law Offices, with an S on it.
 14 **Q. Is that here in Birmingham?**
 15 A. Yes, it is.
 16 **Q. Are you active in any civic organizations**
 17 **or churches or professional groups or anything**
 18 **like that?**
 19 A. In -- yes. I would say yes.
 20 **Q. Okay.**
 21 A. I mean, I'm just trying to think about
 22 the ones that I'm actually involved in as you were
 23 asking me the question, but I am, yes.

Page 26

1 **Q. Would you tell me what civic**
 2 **organizations, professional organizations,**
 3 **churches, et cetera you might be involved in?**
 4 A. I'm involved, naturally, with our bar.
 5 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 6 A. I'm involved with the -- I'm involved
 7 with police athletics.
 8 **Q. Police athletics?**
 9 A. Uh-huh. Police athletics.
 10 **Q. Okay.**
 11 A. You know how you get a blank? I'm
 12 involved with so many things, I --
 13 **Q. Are you a member of the Alabama**
 14 **Legislative Black Caucus?**
 15 A. I am.
 16 **Q. Okay.**
 17 A. I am.
 18 **Q. Are you a member of the Alabama**
 19 **Democratic Party?**
 20 A. Yes, I am.
 21 **Q. And are you a member of the ADC or the**
 22 **New South Coalition or any other group of that**
 23 **sort?**

Page 27

1 A. I have -- I have been from time to time.
 2 I --
 3 **Q. Which one?**
 4 A. I have been a member of ADC. I've been a
 5 member of that.
 6 **Q. When did you cease to be a member of ADC?**
 7 A. Well, it's -- I just hadn't renewed my
 8 membership.
 9 **Q. Okay.**
 10 A. You know, that's what I say -- had to say
 11 it to you that way. You know, I --
 12 **Q. I understand?**
 13 A. I participate, but I just hadn't renewed
 14 my membership.
 15 **Q. All right. I'm sure they'll let you**
 16 **know. Are you active in the Jefferson County**
 17 **Executive Committee?**
 18 A. Not --
 19 **Q. Democratic Executive Committee. Excuse**
 20 **me.**
 21 A. No, I'm not active in it. I go to the
 22 meetings from time to time, but I'm not active in
 23 it.

Page 28

1 **Q. Have you ever served on the Jefferson**
 2 **County Democratic Executive Committee?**
 3 A. No.
 4 **Q. Do you regularly attend local Democratic**
 5 **party functions?**
 6 A. I attend but not on a just regular,
 7 regular basis. But I do attend.
 8 **Q. What kind of functions does the party**
 9 **have here in Jefferson County?**
 10 A. Normally when I go there, it's just
 11 general meeting.
 12 **Q. Of the Democratic Executive Committee?**
 13 A. Yes, of the committee.
 14 **Q. How frequently do they meet?**
 15 A. I don't know.
 16 **Q. Is it just ad hoc? Whenever they feel**
 17 **like they need to?**
 18 A. I don't know.
 19 **Q. Okay.**
 20 A. I hadn't been to but just a few of them.
 21 **Q. All right.**
 22 **Do you, sir, have any social media**
 23 **accounts? Facebook, TikTok, What's App,**



Page 29

1 **Instagram, whatever those things are?**

2 A. I don't know if you call it an account.
3 I mean, just if you -- if you go on probably
4 Facebook, it will show you Smitherman. Won't show
5 you no picture though. And I don't -- I don't --
6 let me say it just like this. I don't communicate
7 on Facebook.

8 **Q. Okay.**

9 A. I don't do any -- or social media really.

10 **Q. Yeah.**

11 A. I don't communicate. And, you know, you
12 might see something somebody else say about you.
13 That's more for me. I just kind of glance at it
14 or look at it.

15 **Q. Well, you and I are alike. I do any
16 social media --**

17 A. Uh-uh. Uh-uh. I don't do any --

18 **Q. But do you ever post anything about
19 redistricting on social media?**

20 A. No.

21 **Q. Okay.**

22 **Senator Smitherman, would you tell me
23 what you understand this lawsuit is about?**

Page 30

1 A. I understand it's about, number one,
2 trying to secure for the minority voters and
3 voters in general two opportunity districts so
4 they have an opportunity, you know, to elect the
5 person of their choice.

6 **Q. Uh-huh.**

7 A. And that's what I understand this suit to
8 be basically about, trying to provide that
9 opportunity for them to have representation.

10 **Q. When you -- when you -- thank you.**

11 **You said number one. Was there a two or
12 three or just that?**

13 A. Oh, I also, having been a constitutional
14 law professor, I understand that there's, you
15 know, other issues there, voting rights issues.

16 **Q. Okay.**

17 A. And there's also constitutional issues.

18 **Q. Well, do you understand that the
19 Smitherman plaintiffs have made a
20 constitutional -- a racial gerrymandering claim?**

21 A. Yes.

22 **Q. Okay. Do you know what other claims are
23 in the second amended complaint?**

Page 31

1 A. Well, I know one of the issues also is
2 the whole county --

3 **Q. Uh-huh.**

4 A. -- constitutionality of preserving the
5 boundary lines of counties. And I understand
6 also -- and this may be akin to what I've already
7 said, but I understand that we're addressing
8 gerrymandering issues as well.

9 **Q. Do you know anything about a Section 2
10 claim?**

11 A. I know that we were involved somewhat,
12 but I'm not -- I don't know to the extent sitting
13 here.

14 **Q. If I were --**

15 A. I couldn't spit it out to you sitting
16 here.

17 **Q. If I were to ask you questions about it,
18 you wouldn't be able to give me any answers of --
19 meaningful?**

20 A. Well, I don't know about that.

21 **Q. Okay.**

22 A. But I know I couldn't give you one
23 knowing in advance.

Page 32

1 **Q. Well, let me just make sure the record is
2 clear. Do you know anything about a Section 2
3 claim made by the Singleton plaintiffs?**

4 A. I'm familiar that's it's a possibility
5 that that claim may be at issue, but I don't
6 know --

7 **Q. Okay.**

8 A. -- to the extent.

9 **Q. Can I ask you how you got involved in
10 this lawsuit?**

11 A. Well, I would like to say this -- but I'm
12 not sure 100 percent because I know we're here
13 where we are, but I've been involved with
14 reapportionments since I've been in the
15 legislature.

16 **Q. Uh-huh.**

17 A. I've been a member of the committee
18 probably longer than anybody in the Alabama
19 senate.

20 **Q. So --**

21 A. So I've been involved in just about every
22 one, you know, as a member of the committee. I've
23 been on the committee with just about every plan



Page 33

1 that we've been going through in this process
 2 since I've been in the legislature.
 3 **Q. Of course, when you started, the**
 4 **Democrats were in the majority.**
 5 A. That's correct.
 6 **Q. And now they're not in the majority?**
 7 A. That's correct.
 8 **Q. How long have you been in the**
 9 **legislature?**
 10 A. I'm working on -- when I go back, I think
 11 this is accurate, give or take a year, I think I'm
 12 working on 30 years.
 13 **Q. Thirty years?**
 14 A. When I go back in our next session.
 15 **Q. So what was the -- did you start in the**
 16 **House or have you always been in the senate?**
 17 A. Nope. I've always been in the senate.
 18 **Q. Okay.**
 19 A. I came off the streets and went in the
 20 senate.
 21 **Q. That's probably unusual, is it, or do you**
 22 **know --**
 23 A. It is, but it's good.

Page 34

1 **Q. Yeah.**
 2 A. Because, you know, you just come with the
 3 same practicality any other citizen would into the
 4 process.
 5 **Q. I like it.**
 6 **So have you always represented the same**
 7 **district?**
 8 A. Yes, I have.
 9 **Q. Has it always been numbered the same?**
 10 A. Yes, it has.
 11 **Q. Has it always been generally the same**
 12 **area as it is now?**
 13 A. Not necessarily, no.
 14 **Q. There have been some changes?**
 15 A. Yes, there have been some changes.
 16 **Q. And has it gotten bigger or smaller? In**
 17 **terms of geography?**
 18 A. In geography? Probably -- I don't know.
 19 About the same. It's just shaped different ways.
 20 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 21 A. You know. So it's about the same, I
 22 would say. Just shaped a little differently.
 23 **Q. Do you have any complaints over the way**

Page 35

1 **your district was drawn after the 2020 census?**
 2 A. You mean this last time?
 3 **Q. Yes, sir.**
 4 A. The way it is drawn now?
 5 **Q. Yes, sir.**
 6 A. Not any -- not any major complaints in
 7 mind simply because, you know, our -- the district
 8 has been pretty much right on the border or a
 9 little less or a little more in voting age. And I
 10 stand corrected, because I know I'm under oath,
 11 but that's just my --
 12 **Q. No, that's fine.**
 13 A. -- guesstimation of that in terms of
 14 white voters.
 15 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 16 A. You know, it's either been 50-50 -- and
 17 I'm talking about voting age people.
 18 **Q. Right.**
 19 A. You know, the population hasn't been that
 20 big a difference. 52, 53, you know, in terms of
 21 that. But the voting age, it's been pretty much
 22 that way since I have been in the district most of
 23 the time.

Page 36

1 **Q. So when did you first run for the senate?**
 2 A. I think it was '94.
 3 **Q. '94? And you think at that time, even at**
 4 **that time, the BVAP for your district was about**
 5 **52, 53?**
 6 A. I'm not sure about that.
 7 **Q. Has it come down over time as you recall?**
 8 A. Well, it's just, you know, in redrawing
 9 the lines, it's been a lot of I guess what we
 10 would call crossover vote.
 11 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 12 A. You know, in some people. And that
 13 hadn't changed. In other words, you know, they
 14 been satisfied with me being -- having me be the
 15 person that's representing them.
 16 **Q. Do you want to -- well, let me back up.**
 17 **When your current district was drawn**
 18 **after the 2020 election, did you meet with**
 19 **Mr. Randy Hinaman to talk about how your district**
 20 **might be redrawn?**
 21 A. I met with -- I don't know his name. I
 22 don't know his name, but I met with someone at
 23 the -- on the reapportionment committee.



Page 37

Page 39

1 **Q. Yeah.**
 2 A. I didn't --
 3 **Q. Do you know if he's the map drawer?**
 4 A. I'm not sure.
 5 **Q. You're not sure? Okay.**
 6 A. Uh-uh. Because...I'm not sure.
 7 **Q. And did he listen to you or explain to**
 8 **you what changes need to be made and listen to you**
 9 **about how you preferred for those changes to be**
 10 **made in terms of population?**
 11 A. Well, he shared with me the way the
 12 districts were leaning with some of my other
 13 colleagues in the county.
 14 **Q. Uh-huh. Uh-huh.**
 15 A. And I -- from there, you know, my
 16 district was put together.
 17 **Q. Were there some areas that you had to**
 18 **give up or -- from your district or -- well, let**
 19 **me just ask that question. Did you have to give**
 20 **up any part of your district to another district?**
 21 A. I did. I gave up Bessemer.
 22 **Q. Bessemer? How long had you represented**
 23 **Bessemer?**

Page 38

1 A. I'm not sure. But I know it had been ten
 2 years, but I'm not sure it was any longer than.
 3 It may have been. Probably was, to be real. I
 4 just don't know the number of years that it was.
 5 **Q. What were your feelings about giving up**
 6 **Bessemer?**
 7 A. It gave them the opportunity to be whole.
 8 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 9 A. You know that -- in other words, they
 10 could be under one senator.
 11 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 12 A. That was the focal point. You know, they
 13 were having to have two senators. It just -- you
 14 know, they have a chance now to just be whole.
 15 **Q. Did you acquire any geography from other**
 16 **districts?**
 17 A. Yes. I acquired -- I'm trying to think
 18 of the direction that I told him. Acquired some
 19 of the Ensley area, out in that area. And I think
 20 at that time, Senator Coleman-Madison was
 21 representing them.
 22 **Q. Senator who, sir?**
 23 A. Coleman-Madison.

1 **Q. Okay.**
 2 A. That was part of her old district.
 3 **Q. Did you have a choice between areas that**
 4 **you could expand to that you went over with the**
 5 **map drawer and settled on the Ensley area, do you**
 6 **know? Do you recall?**
 7 A. Not necessarily. Well, I'll put it this
 8 way. There were precincts. There were precincts
 9 that were open in those directions.
 10 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 11 A. And but I just accepted those precincts.
 12 **Q. What percent do you think of your**
 13 **district stayed the same after your district was**
 14 **redrawn? Do you understand my question?**
 15 A. I understand it. The majority of it did.
 16 To give you an exact percentage, I couldn't. But
 17 I would say the majority of it did.
 18 **Q. What is the benefit to voters, to your**
 19 **constituents, of having somebody like you**
 20 **represent them for a long period of time as you**
 21 **have done?**
 22 A. I think that it allows the voters to
 23 really get to know you.

Page 40

1 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 2 A. You know. And I think that, in
 3 particular here in Jefferson County, you know, it
 4 allows voters to be comfortable with, lack of
 5 better word, crossing over.
 6 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 7 A. You know, the opportunity, in other
 8 words. That's what I'm saying, the opportunity.
 9 Because the longevity of the years that I've been
 10 in the district, as I told you, is about 50-50 or
 11 so, give or take a few points either way. Being
 12 able to represent them over this period of time,
 13 it surely -- it tells you that, you know, it's
 14 sort of like an opportunity district --
 15 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 16 A. -- you know, because you have blacks, you
 17 have whites, you have even Republicans who may
 18 come over and vote, you know, if they're given an
 19 opportunity. So it's kind of like a model of
 20 what -- you know, back then, I didn't think of it
 21 that way, but as we move forward in opportunity
 22 districts --
 23 **Q. Uh-huh.**



Page 41

1 A. -- I look at my breakdown of my
2 constituents and I look at the areas you've heard
3 me mention, Homewood, Hoover --
4 **Q. Yes, sir.**
5 A. -- Mountain Brook, and which those areas
6 are not predominantly African American at all, but
7 they would, you know, vote. And I think that
8 that's kind of a reflection of when you talk about
9 an opportunity district, that that's an
10 opportunity. And I think the longevity, the had a
11 chance to see, you know, what kind of legislator I
12 am. From there, they would support it -- they are
13 supportive.
14 **Q. So would it be fair to say that the more**
15 **they can see of how you have represented the**
16 **district, the more comfortable they are in voting**
17 **for you?**
18 A. Well, I think, naturally, when a person
19 can see your performance, then take can make an
20 individual judgment as to, you know, what they
21 think about it. And over the course of time,
22 they've had a chance to see that.
23 **Q. When I asked you earlier what you**

Page 42

1 understood this lawsuit was about, you said trying
2 to secure for minority voters and voters in
3 general an opportunity district. And that may not
4 be exactly what you said, but I think that's
5 generally what you said.
6 When you said minority voters, were you
7 preferring principally to black voters?
8 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.
9 Go ahead.
10 A. Well, I was referring to in general
11 minority voters.
12 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay.**
13 A. But in particular, black voters.
14 **Q. Okay. Is there a significant or**
15 **meaningful Hispanic population in your district?**
16 A. It's -- it's a lot -- it's a lot of them.
17 You know, I won't say, you know, to a large,
18 large degree.
19 **Q. Uh-huh.**
20 A. But there is a, you know, good number of
21 Hispanic voters in this district.
22 **Q. What's the -- scratch that.**
23 **So you've said that your BVAP and your,**

Page 43

1 I guess, WVAP are maybe within the same range of
2 each other. Maybe the BVAP is about 52, and I
3 guess the white voting age population is maybe 48
4 or a little space in there for Hispanics or
5 something like that? Is that generally your
6 district?
7 A. I would say that the percentage that
8 makes up minorities includes those Hispanics.
9 **Q. Okay. When you say that?**
10 A. I would think that that would be the
11 case.
12 **Q. So about 52 percent --**
13 A. Now, I could be corrected --
14 **Q. No --**
15 A. -- but I think that's the case.
16 **Q. Well, can we agree that --**
17 MR. BLACKSHER: Y'all are jumping in
18 again.
19 MR. WALKER: I'm sorry. I told you I was
20 going to do that, and I did. My apology.
21 **Q. Can we agree that the statistics**
22 **maintained by the reapportionment office would be**
23 **correct on that point?**

Page 44

1 A. I -- I would have to --
2 **Q. Yeah.**
3 A. -- agree until I can see otherwise.
4 **Q. And just to make clear -- I think you**
5 **mentioned this. You've been -- I first started**
6 **working for the reapportionment committee after**
7 **the 1990 census, and you've been on it pretty much**
8 **the same time. Is that correct?**
9 A. That's correct.
10 **Q. All throughout.**
11 A. Now, that's starting in '94 and '95, now.
12 I wasn't there in '90.
13 **Q. I was surprised to see -- maybe in the**
14 **last year or so, I was in Donna's office. And,**
15 **for some reason, she had that contract from '90**
16 **out.**
17 A. Yeah.
18 **Q. And Dave Boyd and I were hired to**
19 **represent the committee. A long time ago.**
20 **Let's go back to the question I asked**
21 **you a while ago, how did you get involved in this**
22 **lawsuit. Who did you talk to about getting**
23 **involved in the lawsuit?**



Page 45

1 A. I don't recall talking to anyone but
2 myself. You know, I'm not saying that I didn't
3 have, you know, just general conversations with
4 someone that was concerned about us having an
5 opportunity to have more than one district or an
6 opportunity to elect someone from more than one
7 district. I'm sure I've had some conversations.
8 I can't recall specifically --

9 **Q. Okay.**

10 A. -- with that person on that date. But
11 it's a concern of mine.

12 **Q. Well, I understand --**

13 A. It's a concern of constituents. You
14 know, I represent this general area, you know, up
15 here.

16 **Q. Right.**

17 A. And we have constituents up here who are
18 very concerned about those issues.

19 **Q. Understand that.**

20 **So you had this concern. And it's kind**
21 **of a concern that you've always had?**

22 A. Yes.

23 **Q. But what was the next step? Something**

Page 46

1 **had to happen to get a group of plaintiffs**
2 **together to get a lawsuit written and everything.**
3 **Maybe you contacted Mr. Blacksher or something. I**
4 **mean, I'm just making stuff up. I don't know.**
5 **What happened next?**

6 A. I can't recall the actual next step --

7 **Q. Yeah.**

8 A. -- or anything like that. I know we had
9 conversations in our Caucus meetings, you know,
10 regarding representation and trying to, you know,
11 see what we need to do to move forward to provide
12 that opportunity district.

13 **Q. And when you say Caucus meeting, is that**
14 **the Alabama Legislative Black Caucus?**

15 A. Yes. I think in particular, we had
16 conversations with the senate Black Caucus.

17 **Q. Okay.**

18 A. And then I think that ultimately, we did
19 have some conversations at the Legislative Black
20 Caucus meetings. But primarily, my conversations
21 started with the senate Black Caucus.

22 **Q. Do you recall anyone else you talked to**
23 **or anyone that you talked to in the process of**

Page 47

1 **getting involved in this lawsuit?**

2 A. Well, I mean, after getting -- moving
3 forward, naturally, we have counsel.

4 **Q. Uh-huh. Yeah.**

5 A. You know. But not any deciding to get
6 into it. You know --

7 **Q. Yeah.**

8 A. -- I didn't have -- I don't recall any
9 conversations with -- that I did.

10 **Q. Senator Smitherman, were the**
11 **conversations that you had with the Senate Black**
12 **Caucus or the Alabama Legislative Black Caucus,**
13 **was there an attorney present for those**
14 **conversations? Are they privileged or not?**

15 A. I don't recall having an attorney at the
16 Senate Black Caucus meetings.

17 **Q. Okay. Can you then recall anything that**
18 **was discussed or said at the senate Caucus meeting**
19 **at which this lawsuit was discussed?**

20 A. Well, I can just share with you that
21 the -- it was a general feeling that the whole
22 counties would be the best approach and keeping
23 the counties together, all together, keep them

Page 48

1 whole as possible.

2 **Q. Uh-huh.**

3 A. And that because of the performance of
4 Jefferson County as it relates to the electing of
5 judges, of course, as I shared with you my
6 district, you know, the makeup of it, and that,
7 number one, it should be kept whole but also that
8 it was the best area to have an opportunity
9 district. And so those are the kind of
10 conversations that, you know, that took place.

11 **Q. Now, it seems like y'all took a -- well,**
12 **y'all did -- took a different approach than the**
13 **Milligan and the Caster plaintiffs have taken in**
14 **that what you're proposing, if I understand the**
15 **complaint correctly, is that the court create two**
16 **opportunity districts in which the BVAP is less**
17 **than 50 percent. Is that correct?**

18 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

19 A. Yes, those two plans.

20 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Uh-huh.**

21 A. I mean, those two opportunity districts.

22 **Q. Right.**

23 A. One of them was right at close to 50.



Page 49

1 Q. Right.

2 A. And the other was, of course, below 50.

3 Q. Was there any conversation that you can
4 recall about the wisdom or the advisability of
5 switching from one, I think we can say, more or
6 less guaranteed black Congressional district in
7 favor of two less than 50 percent crossover
8 districts that -- where the performance was you
9 had to pull, haul, and trade in order to make that
10 work to elect the black candidate of choice? Do
11 you understand my question?

12 A. Would you say that again?

13 Q. Yeah, I kind of convoluted that question.
14 What we had coming into the 2020 census
15 was one black district, CD-7; right?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. And that has always been above 50 percent
18 BVAP; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. So it was I think everybody has tended to
21 look at that, particularly with the record of the
22 incumbent now, as a safe black district. Would
23 you agree with me on that?

Page 50

1 A. Say that -- about the safe black
2 district.

3 Q. Yeah, that we've tended to view his --
4 CD-7 as a safe black district. It's been a
5 district that has reliably elected the black
6 candidate over the last 20, 30 years?

7 A. It has reliably elected a black
8 candidate. You're correct about that.

9 Q. Yeah. And now you're asking the court to
10 create, instead of one reliable black district,
11 two opportunity districts that, I mean, would you
12 agree with me that it's not guaranteed that the
13 minority can elect its candidate of choice?

14 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

15 A. Well, I would think that in those
16 districts that they could. And I'll tell you in
17 part because of the functionality reports.

18 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Uh-huh.

19 A. Or the functionality report of this area
20 and -- you know, Jefferson County --

21 Q. Yeah.

22 A. -- and this area in terms of the second
23 opportunity district has demonstrated itself in

Page 51

1 this county. You know, as I said earlier, you
2 know, the election of our judges, election of --
3 you know, me being in the senate.

4 Q. Right.

5 A. That the functionality of this district
6 is solid to the point where an opportunity would
7 exist for an African American to have a chance to
8 be elected in this particular area.

9 That was one of the things that
10 concerned me about the whole process is that those
11 functionality reports and what they showed --

12 Q. Uh-huh.

13 A. -- in terms of actually having an
14 opportunity. Not just numbers but the
15 performance.

16 Q. Right.

17 A. Over like a 10- or 12-year period. And
18 we had a chance to look at those performances, you
19 know, and this area just clearly outperformed any
20 other area surrounding it.

21 Although I will say this, that I
22 support, you know, the court's plan now because
23 it's an opportunity district.

Page 52

1 Q. Uh-huh.

2 A. And -- but I just think that the better
3 opportunity district is on this end. But I do
4 support their plan regarding opportunity
5 districts.

6 Q. I understand that. And I think it's a
7 given that y'all concluded that the opportunity
8 districts would work because you went forward with
9 promoting that plan.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. I was asking a question that was a little
12 bit different from that.

13 A. Oh, I'm sorry.

14 Q. When the idea of the opportunity
15 districts was first promoted, first came up for
16 discussion, was there any back-and-forth about
17 well, we got a bird in the hand now in CD-7, and
18 you're asking us to go to two districts that may
19 or may not perform?

20 I mean, notwithstanding the performance
21 reports that you saw, would you agree with me that
22 there is a possibility that the two opportunity
23 districts that -- or at least one of the two



Page 53

1 opportunity districts that are in the
2 court-Ordered Plan or that were in your plan could
3 elect a white candidate instead of a black
4 candidate?

5 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

6 A. Well, it's no written guarantee --

7 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Right.

8 A. -- in any race --

9 Q. Right.

10 A. -- that this person or this party are not
11 as assured, you know -- I mean, I'm getting
12 elected and there have been districts that -- you
13 know, in other kind of races. I'll just take one
14 area that I think about is the city of Oakman.

15 Q. Yeah.

16 A. I mean, you know, gosh, you know, they
17 elected a white male as their mayor. So it's --
18 even though it's predominantly, predominantly
19 African American. But I do think those
20 opportunity districts provide a very good
21 opportunity.

22 And one of the other things is that the
23 growing population in the state, it was a concern

Page 54

1 that you had a disenfranchisement of African
2 American voters where they didn't have an
3 opportunity to elect a candidate of their choice.

4 Q. Uh-huh.

5 A. So that's -- you know, that was one of
6 the concerns as well in our conversation, that
7 they should have an opportunity to do that and the
8 opportunity district will provide it.

9 Because, you know, if you -- even though
10 we said 7 was a safe district -- you made that
11 reference. But it's -- in all actuality, you
12 know, it was -- it was stacking.

13 Q. Uh-huh.

14 A. You're talking about 65 and 70 percent
15 African Americans in a district. And don't hold
16 me to the exact figure of 65 or 70. But a
17 large --

18 Q. Uh-huh.

19 A. -- percentage of African Americans just
20 put in that district. And that was a -- that's a
21 concern.

22 Q. Uh-huh.

23 A. You know, the other concern is that, of

Page 55

1 course, you know, that's why we -- I supported the
2 whole county plan is simply the fact that, you
3 know, you go in and kind of split the county
4 across the middle and, you know, you
5 disenfranchise two sets of people.

6 Q. Uh-huh.

7 A. You send the black people down here --
8 not "you," but I'm --

9 Q. Yeah.

10 A. -- just saying you send the black people
11 down to 7 and then you send the white people over
12 here to 6.

13 Q. Uh-huh.

14 A. You know. And, of course, you know, this
15 district then, that's a concern because you have
16 communities of interest all through and out this
17 county, that it's not isolated where you should
18 separate --

19 Q. Uh-huh.

20 A. -- the county like that, the whole county
21 as a whole.

22 I think we saw that in the -- I'm not --
23 I don't -- I'm not getting the name, but when they

Page 56

1 sent the money to the state to help out. I
2 forgot --

3 Q. The COVID?

4 A. Yeah, it may have been the COVID or it
5 may have been other money. They sent Jefferson
6 County money direct to Jefferson County.

7 Q. Uh-huh.

8 A. Not through the state. It was the only
9 county in the state that received its money
10 straight to it because of the size of the county
11 and the multitude of, you know, people that it has
12 to help --

13 Q. Uh-huh.

14 A. -- that they sent it straight to them.
15 So that's what I meant by splitting it.

16 You know, as a whole as a county, we
17 intertwine with each other.

18 Q. Yeah.

19 A. You know, and, you know, work very well
20 together. So it kind of does us a disservice to
21 split us up like that.

22 Q. Can it work in the county's advantage to
23 have two members of Congress representing it



Page 57

1 instead of one? Has Terry Sewell, who is the
2 representative from CD-7, long-term representative
3 from CD-7, has she consistently worked with the
4 white representative representing the other parts
5 of Jefferson County?

6 A. I don't know.

7 **Q. You don't know?**

8 A. But I will say that it's not to our
9 advantage at all. I mean, simply because we are
10 in 7. 7 goes all the way down in the Black Belt.

11 **Q. Uh-huh.**

12 A. Whatever resources that are provided for
13 this county from that perspective has to be
14 distributed throughout from this part of Jefferson
15 County all the way down to the Black Belt. We
16 have sometimes rural people have different needs
17 and concerns than people in the urban area. And
18 so you can understand what I mean by that. If we
19 had the whole county and all the resources came to
20 this county --

21 **Q. Uh-huh.**

22 A. -- then the multitude of issues in this
23 county itself could be addressed. But right now,

Page 58

1 we're having to share those resources with
2 everybody in the Black Belt. And then on the
3 other end of the county, we've had to share those
4 resources with everybody in Shelby County and, you
5 know, all of the makeup of 6. So it's at a big
6 disadvantage for us here, you know, in terms of
7 those resources because this is a county -- don't
8 hold me to the figure --

9 **Q. Uh-huh.**

10 A. -- but this is a county of about seven
11 hundred, eight hundred thousand people, you know,
12 in just one county.

13 **Q. Yes, sir.**

14 A. And those resources, as I said earlier,
15 are being split up among all these other counties.
16 Instead of us getting them all, we're just getting
17 a little fraction based on how many other counties
18 are getting, sharing --

19 **Q. And you mentioned that rural people have
20 different needs and concerns or some different
21 needs and concerns from people in an urban county
22 like Jefferson County, if I understood you
23 correctly. What would be some examples of that?**

Page 59

1 A. Oh, you know, quality of their water.

2 **Q. Okay.**

3 A. Quality of sewage; food deserts; you
4 know, the roads; schools. Those kind of things.

5 **Q. And those are areas in which rural people
6 have maybe different needs and concerns than the
7 people who live in Jefferson County?**

8 A. Well, I would say yeah simply because of
9 you take our education, our formula dealing with
10 the millage. You know 10 mills in Hale County is
11 not 10 mills in Mountain Brook. That's what I
12 meant. It's just -- so it's going to create a
13 bigger need for them. So if we have education
14 dollars, for them to -- just to get baseline, it's
15 going to take more of the dollars for that and
16 it's going to take dollars away from us up here,
17 although we have the largest population.

18 **Q. Do you know any of the other Singleton
19 plaintiffs? I'm going to say you know Senator
20 Rodger Singleton?**

21 A. Senator who?

22 **Q. Singleton.**

23 A. I know Senator Singleton, yes.

Page 60

1 **Q. You know him. Do you know Eddie
2 Billingsley?**

3 A. I've met Eddie Billingsley.

4 **Q. Just that though?**

5 A. Yeah. I've met him. I can't recall when
6 or how long it was.

7 **Q. Was it in connection with this lawsuit?
8 Or some other time?**

9 A. No.

10 **Q. Is he involved in politics in Jefferson
11 County?**

12 A. I don't know.

13 **Q. Okay. What about Leonette Slay? Have
14 you met Ms. Slay?**

15 A. Not to recall. You know, if she walked
16 in here, I probably wouldn't know her to look.
17 But after talking, I may say "Oh, yeah, I met her
18 somewhere, yeah," you know, that kind of thing.

19 **Q. Oh, yeah. Well, you're a politician.
20 You meet lots of people.**

21 **What about the Reverend Darryl Walker?
22 Do you know him?**

23 A. I know -- I've heard his name and know of



Senator Rodger Smitherman

61..64

Page 61

1 him, but I don't -- we don't have a personal
 2 relationship or anything like that.
 3 **Q. What about the Reverend Andrew Walker?**
 4 A. The same.
 5 **Q. Same? Okay.**
 6 **Did you recruit any of the plaintiffs**
 7 **for this litigation?**
 8 A. No.
 9 **Q. Okay. Did you see the original complaint**
 10 **that was filed in September of '21? Do you recall**
 11 **if you saw it or not?**
 12 A. I can't recall.
 13 **Q. Okay. Do you recall if you saw the first**
 14 **amended complaint that was filed I think later**
 15 **that -- in like November maybe?**
 16 A. I probably did, but I just can't recall.
 17 **Q. Do you recall if you have seen the second**
 18 **amended complaint, the operative version -- the**
 19 **operative complaint in this case?**
 20 A. I'm sure I did.
 21 **Q. Do you recall --**
 22 A. But I just don't recall when.
 23 **Q. Do you recall anything about it?**

Page 62

1 A. Not by memory.
 2 **Q. Okay.**
 3 A. Not by memory. No, I didn't seek to
 4 memorize anything.
 5 **Q. I understand.**
 6 **Do you know if you saw it before -- when**
 7 **I say "it," I'm referring now to the second**
 8 **amended complaint. Do you know if you saw the**
 9 **second amended complaint before it was filed?**
 10 A. I'm sure I did.
 11 **Q. Okay.**
 12 A. I'm sure I did.
 13 **Q. Have you read any of the expert reports**
 14 **submitted in this case?**
 15 A. I remember having some just conversations
 16 about it. And I may have had a chance to look at
 17 it. I -- look at the brief, the first part of it
 18 or something.
 19 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 20 A. I just can't recall whether I have or
 21 have not.
 22 **Q. And I assume from that that if I were to**
 23 **ask you what you recall about any of those expert**

Page 63

1 **reports, you don't recall that either?**
 2 A. No. I couldn't give you --
 3 **Q. Okay.**
 4 A. You know. Because I didn't reduce it to
 5 memory, you know. You can understand.
 6 **Q. I know.**
 7 **You mentioned some performance reports**
 8 **that you looked at. Was that before you became a**
 9 **plaintiff in this lawsuit or when was it, if you**
 10 **recall?**
 11 A. I can't recall. I can't recall. I
 12 just -- I know that I, during the course of the
 13 bill and conversations with the bill, I looked at
 14 several of those.
 15 **Q. Do you recall --**
 16 A. And requested some other ones that I
 17 didn't receive from the committee.
 18 **Q. Do you recall looking at any polarization**
 19 **studies, racial polarization studies, in**
 20 **connection with either the redistricting after the**
 21 **2020 census or this lawsuit?**
 22 A. I can't recall.
 23 **Q. Okay. Do you recall -- I think you've**

Page 64

1 **covered that.**
 2 **Have you read any of the court opinions**
 3 **in this case?**
 4 A. The most recent one. The last one. I
 5 read over it.
 6 **Q. Denying the motion to dismiss?**
 7 A. No, just the -- I think what I recall is
 8 the instructions that the court gave the -- is it
 9 the standing master? That actually approves --
 10 **Q. The special master?**
 11 A. Yeah.
 12 **Q. Okay. That one --**
 13 A. Yeah, yeah. I just kind of remember
 14 reading over it, but I don't recall, you know, by
 15 memory it but I remember reading over it. Because
 16 one of the concerns that I had was the fact that
 17 there were numbers being presented, but how did it
 18 stack up in the functionality study of actually an
 19 opportunity for folks to get elected? Not just
 20 numbers but the study itself, that would have
 21 shown performances. And I do recall that the best
 22 performance, as I said earlier, was up here in
 23 Jefferson County in terms of opportunity to be



Page 65

1 able to provide --
 2 **Q. Can you describe the performance reports**
 3 **that you saw? How did they measure performance of**
 4 **the minority population?**

5 A. Well, it wasn't so much the performance
 6 that I noticed of the majority -- that I noticed
 7 of the -- you said majority?

8 **Q. I said minority.**

9 A. Minority.

10 **Q. Yes.**

11 A. Minority population. What I wondered --
 12 noticed is that in a district where it was not
 13 predominantly majority African American, whether
 14 or not there would be voters who would be, lack of
 15 better word, independent voters --

16 **Q. Uh-huh.**

17 A. -- who would be willing to, you know,
 18 vote for whatever candidate that was the best
 19 candidate. And looking at those performances, as
 20 I said earlier, it clearly showed here that these
 21 citizens were very open-minded and --

22 **Q. Do you recall the methodology of the**
 23 **report to reach that conclusion?**

Page 66

1 A. Looking at past elections, the
 2 performance in those elections.

3 **Q. In other words, did the reports that**
 4 **you're talking about look at how voters had voted**
 5 **in the geographic area covered by a proposed**
 6 **Congressional district?**

7 A. I think you're right.

8 **Q. Okay. Over a series of different**
 9 **elections?**

10 A. Yeah. And times.

11 **Q. And times. Yes. Okay.**

12 And I probably asked you this, but let
 13 me ask you again to make sure I -- so I can move
 14 on. Do you recall who authored those reports?

15 A. Not authored them. I don't.

16 **Q. Okay.**

17 A. You know, I don't recall that. No, I
 18 don't recall who actually authored them, no.

19 **Q. If, after a trial of the Singleton**
 20 **complaint, y'all were to prevail, what do you want**
 21 **the court to do?**

22 A. Number one, I want the court to ensure
 23 that we would have two opportunity districts. I

Page 67

1 would either want the court to stay with the
 2 district that it has or accept the district that
 3 was provided at the Singleton district -- the
 4 Singleton Plan.

5 **Q. In short, did you say you would want the**
 6 **court either to stay with the Special Master Plan**
 7 **Number 3 that the court ordered into effect or**
 8 **adopt the Singleton Plan?**

9 A. Yes, sir.

10 **Q. And that would be the Singleton Plan with**
 11 **the zeroed out deviations?**

12 A. Yes, with the Jefferson County being
 13 whole as a Congressional district.

14 **Q. Okay. Do you recall -- let me start**
 15 **over.**

16 Senator Smitherman, have you ever seen
 17 any of the population estimates that are put out
 18 by the census bureau in the period of time between
 19 the decennial censuses?

20 A. Explain that to me. Please.

21 **Q. Okay. You know, every ten years we get**
 22 **the census.**

23 A. That's correct.

Page 68

1 **Q. And that gives us the official count of**
 2 **how many people are in Hale County and Jefferson**
 3 **County and all the counties in Alabama.**

4 A. That's correct.

5 **Q. And so we got that. And then in the time**
 6 **between that, of course, there are people moving**
 7 **around all the time. And the census bureau comes**
 8 **out with estimates. Have you ever looked at any**
 9 **of those estimates to your recollection?**

10 A. No, I can't recall looking at any of
 11 those estimates.

12 **Q. Do you know generally what has happened**
 13 **to the population of the counties in the Black**
 14 **Belt?**

15 Well, let me ask that question better.

16 Do you know generally what happened to
 17 the population of the counties in the Black Belt
 18 from the 2010 census to the 2020 census?

19 A. No, I don't.

20 **Q. Do you know whether the census showed**
 21 **that most of those counties had suffered decline**
 22 **in population?**

23 A. I didn't see any report that showed that.



Page 69

1 Q. You don't know that? I'm sorry. Did I
2 cut you out?
3 A. I'm just not familiar with any report.
4 Q. Do you know whether the estimates that
5 the census bureau has released since the 2020
6 census data were released, if those estimates also
7 show that most of the counties in the Black Belt
8 have continued to lose population?
9 A. Say that again?
10 Q. Sure.
11 A. Not the last part. The first part. Say
12 that again?
13 Q. Do you know whether the estimates of
14 Alabama county population published by the census
15 bureau after the 2020 census data became available
16 show that most counties in the Black Belt are
17 continuing to lose population?
18 A. I haven't seen that report.
19 Q. Do you have any sense yourself about
20 population loss or gain in the counties in the
21 Black Belt?
22 A. No, I'm not -- I'm not close enough, you
23 know, in my day-to-day activities or in my

Page 70

1 activities going in that area to be observant --
2 you know, observant of whether that does or does
3 not take place from that perspective.
4 Q. And when I say Black Belt, let's make
5 sure we're on the same sheet of music. I'm
6 referring to these counties: Barbour, Bullock,
7 Butler, Choctaw, Crenshaw, Dallas, Greene, Hale,
8 Lowndes, Macon, Marengo, Montgomery, Perry,
9 Pickens, Pike, Russell, Sumter, and Wilcox. Is
10 that what you understand to be the Black Belt?
11 A. Pretty much, yes.
12 Q. Okay. How often do you go to any of
13 those counties? You come to Montgomery, I guess,
14 periodically for legislative stuff.
15 A. That's true.
16 Q. Do you come to Montgomery for any other
17 reason, sir?
18 A. Not unless it's -- you know, the Alabama
19 High School Athletic Association has activities or
20 something of that nature. But other than that, I
21 don't -- I don't -- you know, I'm down there so
22 much in the legislature that I stay back a lot of
23 times on this end, you know.

Page 71

1 Q. What I've --
2 A. But I've been to, you know, Selma a
3 couple times, you know.
4 Q. Well, we'll go over that.
5 What's your connection to the Alabama
6 High School Athletic Association?
7 A. I'm a coach.
8 Q. Oh, I didn't know that.
9 A. I coach basketball at Ramsay High School.
10 Boy's basketball. As I tell people, I'm a
11 card-carrying coach. I'm not just somebody who
12 volunteers sitting over there at the --
13 Q. You're the real thing?
14 A. Yeah, I'm the real thing.
15 Q. Are you still coaching?
16 A. Still coaching.
17 Q. How long you been coaching?
18 A. I'm going to the school this evening when
19 I get off from work.
20 Q. Oh, okay. All right.
21 A. I been coaching -- coaching itself.
22 Q. Yes, sir.
23 A. Not at Ramsay but coaching --

Page 72

1 Q. Both?
2 A. Well, this is going on my 44th straight
3 year coaching at some level.
4 Q. Uh-huh.
5 A. And I've been coaching at Ramsay High
6 School since 1985.
7 Q. I'll be darned.
8 A. Started the girls team with a group of
9 people.
10 Q. Uh-huh.
11 A. Started the football team. We started
12 the baseball -- over. You know, they stopped it
13 and, during the term of integration, they kind of
14 froze those activities, but we started all those
15 back.
16 Q. I remember when I was at junior high at
17 Cloverdale in Montgomery, the girls teams had to
18 have -- I think they had to have seven players.
19 It was -- it was like ridiculous.
20 A. Uh-huh.
21 Q. Very different rules about how they could
22 play too. I don't think they could -- some of
23 them couldn't cross -- I don't know. It was a



Page 73

1 different game.

2 A. Well, you know, I like to think it's fun
3 coaching. You know, I've won four state
4 championships.

5 Q. Congratulations.

6 A. And the key element to it all, I've never
7 accepted a dime of pay. From the board.

8 Q. That's very commendable.

9 A. I don't take a penny.

10 Q. You get paid in other ways?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Yeah.

13 I forgot to ask what committees you're
14 on. I know you're on reapportionment.

15 A. Judiciary, F&T, education, budget.

16 Q. And for the record, would you spell out
17 F&T?

18 A. Finance and taxation. Education
19 committee.

20 Q. So four committees?

21 A. No, I -- I'm on rules.

22 Q. Rules?

23 A. I'm on banking and insurance.

Page 74

1 Q. I've got --

2 A. Confirmation. Confirmation.

3 Q. Confirmation?

4 A. Education policy.

5 Q. Is that different from education?

6 A. Yeah. That's where we make the policies
7 and rules on education policy. Of course, the --

8 Q. That's a lot of committees.

9 A. Yeah, it's -- and the budget is where we
10 deal with the money.

11 Q. Uh-huh. Do you chair any of these
12 committees right now?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Have you chaired any of them in the past?

15 A. Yes. I've chaired judiciary in the past
16 for about ten years.

17 Q. Did you attend any of the legislative
18 hearings before redistricting, before the 2020
19 redistricting was done in 2021?

20 A. What hearings are you referring to?

21 Q. Let me back up. Thank you.

22 If you'll recall, the committee had a
23 series of about 23, 24 hearings around the state

Page 75

1 to take input from people on how they wanted the
2 Congressional districts, the State Board of
3 Education districts, the House districts and the
4 Senate districts drawn. Do you recall that?

5 A. I do.

6 Q. And this year, instead of traveling
7 around, we did them all by Zoom, which was a lot
8 easier. Did you attend any of those, sir?

9 A. I think I attended the one at Lawson
10 State. I think it was the one there at Lawson
11 State.

12 Q. Do you know if you spoke at that one?

13 A. I'm not sure.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I --

16 Q. Did you?

17 A. Come to think about it, there was some
18 conversation about opportunity districts. I may
19 have made a comment.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. Something like that.

22 Q. And did you submit any maps to the
23 legislature?

Page 76

1 A. For the opportunity districts. The whole
2 county plan.

3 Q. You submitted the whole county plan?

4 A. The whole county plan.

5 Q. Also known as the Smitherman Plan?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Did you develop that with Donna and her
8 staff in the reapportionment office or was that
9 developed somewhere else?

10 A. I think it was developed somewhere else.

11 Q. Okay. Do you know where?

12 A. I don't quite recall right off. I don't.

13 Q. Do you know who developed it?

14 A. I can't recall the name. I can't recall
15 the name.

16 Q. How did that plan, the whole county
17 plan/Smitherman Plan come to your attention?

18 A. Well, the fact that I myself was very
19 concerned with splitting of the counties --

20 Q. Uh-huh.

21 A. -- particularly Jefferson County.

22 Q. Uh-huh.

23 A. And, you know, we had conversations



Page 77

1 and -- regarding about the need for a whole county
 2 plan. And it would seem like the committee could
 3 not put a whole county plan out there.
 4 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 5 A. So at that point I -- I got interested in
 6 seeing what we could do to get a whole county
 7 plan.
 8 **Q. So did you talk to someone or did someone**
 9 **come to you because they knew you had an interest**
 10 **in it and say hey, we've drawn this plan? Or do**
 11 **you recall what happened?**
 12 A. I can't recall what happened exactly.
 13 (Defendant's Exhibit 1 was marked
 14 for identification and copy of
 15 same is attached hereto.)
 16 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) I show you, Senator**
 17 **Smitherman, what was previously introduced as**
 18 **Document 242-4, which is the 2021 Plan. And if**
 19 **you'll turn over to the back, that's the**
 20 **2021 Plan, the Congressional Plan. Do you**
 21 **recognize that?**
 22 A. I've seen this plan before.
 23 **Q. What did you like and not like about the**

Page 78

1 **2021 Plan?**
 2 A. Compared to what? That's the way I
 3 probably ought to ask you. Compared to?
 4 **Q. Well, certainly compared to the**
 5 **Smitherman Plan, it doesn't have --**
 6 A. Oh, now I'm with you. We're together
 7 now.
 8 **Q. All right. Answer that way if you want**
 9 **to.**
 10 A. I know what you mean.
 11 You say what I thought about this plan.
 12 I thought that this plan -- and still do, the
 13 resemblance of it, that it's gerrymandering.
 14 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 15 A. I think that it's -- it was, you know --
 16 you hate to say the realities of the truth, but
 17 it's racially split up. I mean, this bottom part
 18 is predominantly African American, and the top
 19 part is predominantly white. And it was split up
 20 that way.
 21 And you can see the way the district is
 22 when I was talking about the resources. You know,
 23 that if you look, you look at this part of

Page 79

1 Jefferson County, you look at --
 2 **Q. Are you talking about the part of**
 3 **Jefferson County in CD-7?**
 4 A. In 7, yes.
 5 **Q. Uh-huh. Yes, sir.**
 6 A. You look at the counties that's connected
 7 to it, and the resources that go in that district
 8 has got to go all the way down to these people as
 9 well.
 10 **Q. All the way down to Clarke County?**
 11 A. Yes.
 12 **Q. Yeah.**
 13 A. And then on the other side, those
 14 resources have got to go all the way down to
 15 Chilton County, through Shelby, Bibb, and up to
 16 Blount.
 17 So the county, you know, we're only
 18 getting a proportion -- you know, whatever that
 19 portion is left -- one, two, three, four, five --
 20 one-fifth in 6, and we're getting one, two, three,
 21 four, five, six, seven, eight, nine, ten, eleven
 22 twelve -- one-twelfth in 7.
 23 **Q. Uh-huh.**

Page 80

1 A. So, I mean, it's really a big disservice
 2 to us in Jefferson County --
 3 **Q. Okay.**
 4 A. -- to be split up like that. And to --
 5 you know, and to the voters as well.
 6 **Q. And you referred to the black population**
 7 **being split up in the southern half of the map, if**
 8 **I understood you. What were you referring to**
 9 **there? The split in the Black Belt? Or something**
 10 **else?**
 11 A. In Jefferson County.
 12 **Q. Oh, in Jefferson County?**
 13 A. I'm talking about Jefferson County.
 14 **Q. I'm sorry. Thank you.**
 15 A. All that conversation was centered around
 16 Jefferson County.
 17 **Q. Okay.**
 18 A. You know, the percentage that we get, you
 19 know, and versus not getting.
 20 **Q. Now I --**
 21 A. No, I was talking about us in Jefferson
 22 County.
 23 **Q. Now I understand what you're saying. The**



Page 81

1 southern part of Jefferson County.
 2 You mentioned your belief that there was
 3 gerrymandering in this map. Were you referring to
 4 Jefferson County or to any other place?

5 A. Well, in Jefferson County. You know. I
 6 think you might have -- you might have had
 7 something similar in -- I don't know. Maybe in
 8 Mobile or in that area. But --

9 Q. Mobile's whole.

10 A. Yeah. But I'm pretty sure that you're
 11 talking about -- well, I may have been talking
 12 about now.

13 Q. Oh, now.

14 A. You got a little split down there.

15 Q. Oh, okay.

16 A. But Jefferson County in this map was what
 17 I was talking primarily. Although there are other
 18 areas --

19 Q. Uh-huh.

20 A. -- but Jefferson County, you know, is my
 21 concern.

22 I see Tuscaloosa the same way. You
 23 know. And even Montgomery to an extent. You

Page 82

1 know.

2 Q. So as you look at this map, the 2021 Map,
 3 is your complaint about racial gerrymandering
 4 focused on Jefferson County or any other places in
 5 addition to Jefferson County?

6 A. Well, Jefferson County is the primary.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. Is my primary. Although there are some
 9 other areas as well.

10 Q. And can you specify those?

11 A. Oh --

12 Q. If you know.

13 A. No. I'm just looking at this in general.
 14 You know, as I mentioned, you have Tuscaloosa. If
 15 I look at this, Montgomery, coming out of Lowndes.
 16 Let me see. Let me see.

17 And, of course -- and, you know, you
 18 have a few other areas that provide -- that may
 19 provide the same thing. I would have to look at
 20 their makeup and -- of those areas in terms of the
 21 population to be sure. I see Lauderdale -- to be
 22 sure about the -- there was one more I saw here.
 23 Like Escambia.

Page 83

1 Q. Escambia. Yeah.

2 A. Yeah, yeah. So I would have to look at
 3 that population just to know because I don't have
 4 those figures in front of me. But I do know in
 5 the Tuscaloosa area, that bottom area is African
 6 American.

7 Q. Do you know --

8 A. Predominantly. Jefferson County
 9 definitely.

10 Q. I'm sorry. I didn't mean to interrupt
 11 you.

12 Do you know whether or not the split in
 13 Tuscaloosa County is along racial lines?

14 A. From my knowledge of Tuscaloosa County, I
 15 would say yes.

16 Q. Okay. Do you know whether or not the
 17 split in Escambia County is on racial lines?

18 A. I don't know.

19 Q. Do you know whether or not the split in
 20 Lauderdale County is on racial lines?

21 A. At this time, I do not know.

22 Q. Okay. And then what about the split in
 23 Montgomery County; do you know whether that was on

Page 84

1 racial lines?

2 A. Yes. I think it was.

3 Q. You think it was?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. What district did you live in under this
 6 map, the 2021 Map? Were you in Congressional
 7 District 7?

8 A. Oh, yes. I live in 7.

9 Q. Do you have any opinion as to what role,
 10 if any, race played in the drawing of this map?

11 A. Yes, I do. I have an opinion.

12 Q. All right. Would you tell me, sir?

13 A. I think race is one of the predominant
 14 things that was in the drawing of this map. You
 15 look at the large numbers of African Americans
 16 being packed over in that district, I think that
 17 race had a lot to do with it.

18 Q. And when you say in that district, you're
 19 referring to the large number of African Americans
 20 in CD-7?

21 A. CD-7, yes.

22 Q. Okay. Any other way in which race in
 23 your opinion played a role in this map?



Page 85

1 A. Yes. The split of Jefferson County.
 2 **Q. Jefferson County? Okay.**
 3 A. And Tuscaloosa.
 4 **Q. And Tuscaloosa?**
 5 A. And Montgomery.
 6 **Q. And Montgomery. Okay.**
 7 **And do you -- other than your opinion,**
 8 **do you have any evidence that you could tell me**
 9 **that race played a role in the way the lines were**
 10 **drawn in Tuscaloosa and Jefferson and Montgomery**
 11 **County?**
 12 A. The numbers, you know, itself speaks for
 13 itself, even though I stated my opinion. I think
 14 if you look at those numbers, if you look at the
 15 numbers and the breakup -- breakdown of those
 16 districts, you'll see where race played a large
 17 factor in the drawing of these districts, how, you
 18 know, the African Americans, if you look at
 19 those -- of course, you know, you can't know by
 20 memory, but if you look at -- I'm not saying you
 21 can't --
 22 **Q. Yeah.**
 23 A. I mean --

Page 86

1 **Q. Oh, trust me, I'm aware of --**
 2 A. But if you look at the precincts.
 3 **Q. Yeah.**
 4 A. And naturally, you know, once you go back
 5 now --
 6 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 7 A. -- that they're drawn and look in these
 8 precincts and see the majority-minority population
 9 in those precincts itself and you see how it's
 10 drawn around, curved around, and they're put over
 11 there, you'll be -- it will be even a lot
 12 clearer --
 13 **Q. Okay.**
 14 A. -- that race was a factor.
 15 **Q. That's a good answer. Thank you.**
 16 **Do you have any opinion, if any, what**
 17 **role politics played in the drawing of this map?**
 18 A. No, I -- I haven't been on
 19 reapportionment. I -- I don't -- I can't see
 20 where -- let me say it like this. No, I can't see
 21 it to that degree. I see more race. I was trying
 22 to figure out how to say that. I see it more on a
 23 racial than on the actual politics itself.

Page 87

1 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 2 A. I mean, you know, we're in a situation --
 3 this is the best way to say it. You'll know what
 4 I was -- we're in a situation where, look, it's 27
 5 versus 8.
 6 **Q. Understand.**
 7 A. You know, if you took out -- let me say
 8 it this way. If you took out -- if you took out 9
 9 on the majority side, you got 18. So politics,
 10 it's not a necessity for politics when you got 27
 11 people. So I can only assume, based on the things
 12 I just told you there was, that race was the
 13 factor. Because you in control. You got the
 14 numbers. You know, it's no need, you know -- you
 15 know, politics? Why would you be concerned about
 16 the politics side of it when you control the
 17 numbers? So it's -- in drawing it, the way it's
 18 made up, I would say that race was the factor.
 19 **Q. And just to be clear on the record, when**
 20 **you said 27 and 8, what you were referring to was**
 21 **27 Republican members of the Alabama senate and 8**
 22 **Democratic members of the Alabama senate; is that**
 23 **correct?**

Page 88

1 A. That's correct, with 7 of the 8 Democrats
 2 being black.
 3 **Q. Right.**
 4 **Could we agree that in any conceivable**
 5 **circumstance here in Alabama, the congressional**
 6 **black candidate of choice is going to be a**
 7 **Democrat?**
 8 A. I don't know. I can't say will or won't.
 9 **Q. Well --**
 10 A. Because I don't, you know -- I would
 11 say -- I would say it would provide -- you know,
 12 when we say about the opportunity district so the
 13 people can vote for the person of their choice.
 14 **Q. Right. Uh-huh.**
 15 A. Now, whether that's going to be a, you
 16 know -- political party, you know, I don't know,
 17 you know, because we've had situations where
 18 people have had the opportunity to elect the
 19 person of their choice, that they have selected --
 20 not in many, but they've selected African
 21 Americans.
 22 **Q. Who do you think is the -- did I cut you**
 23 **off, sir?**



Page 89

1 A. I was just saying they have elected
 2 African Americans.
 3 **Q. Yeah.**
 4 **Who do you think is the black candidate**
 5 **of choice in the race going on in CD-2 now?**
 6 **Between -- go ahead.**
 7 A. Well, you know, we're in the general
 8 election now. So I think the candidate of choice
 9 most likely would be Shomari Figures.
 10 **Q. And why is that?**
 11 A. I mean, because he -- I just think
 12 because of his appeal to the people, you know, his
 13 experience having been in Washington. You know,
 14 his experience, his pedigree. He has an
 15 understanding of the process. His dad was in the
 16 legislature. And so I think that, you know, that
 17 he probably would be, but there's no guarantee
 18 because of the makeup of that district. It's --
 19 as I said earlier, I appreciate the court's
 20 providing an opportunity district, but that
 21 functionality study for that district is not as
 22 solid as the one up here. So I am concerned about
 23 that factor, the functionality study is not as

Page 90

1 solid. And that's why -- one of the reasons why I
 2 would have preferred that that district had been
 3 on this end. On this end.
 4 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 5 A. In Jefferson County being 6, so that we
 6 would have an even greater opportunity of that
 7 taking place.
 8 MR. CLEMON: We've been going about an
 9 hour and a half now. Let's --
 10 MR. WALKER: Yeah, I always lose track of
 11 it, Judge.
 12 Let's take a ten-minute break. It's
 13 10:27. We'll take a little break.
 14 (Recess.)
 15 THE WITNESS: Counsel, I wanted to make
 16 one correction.
 17 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay. Are we on the**
 18 **record? Okay.**
 19 A. On the Zoom meeting --
 20 **Q. Yes, sir.**
 21 A. -- that we had, I said Thursday? Also,
 22 Senator Singleton was on that meeting.
 23 **Q. Okay.**

Page 91

1 A. I just wanted to --
 2 **Q. Thanks for doing that. I appreciate it.**
 3 **We were talking about, when we took our**
 4 **break, the 2021 Plan and I think your, if it's**
 5 **fair to say, disappointment that the legislature**
 6 **didn't pass a plan that had two opportunity**
 7 **districts instead of this plan which had -- which**
 8 **continued, I guess, CD-7. Is that right?**
 9 A. That's correct.
 10 **Q. If the legislature had passed or, looking**
 11 **at it from that point of view at the time, if the**
 12 **legislature had passed a plan with two opportunity**
 13 **districts, was it your belief that those**
 14 **opportunity districts, the ones proposed in your**
 15 **plan, for example, would have returned the black**
 16 **candidate of choice?**
 17 A. Yes.
 18 **Q. The black -- would have won in those two**
 19 **districts?**
 20 A. Yes.
 21 **Q. And that candidate, more likely than not,**
 22 **would have been Democrat; is that correct?**
 23 A. In 7, it probably would. I can't assure

Page 92

1 what it would have been in the, you know, second
 2 district, opportunity district but --
 3 **Q. Well, do you think it --**
 4 A. I can't assure it would have been in 7,
 5 but I think the probability is a lot higher.
 6 **Q. I think we could think and hope that**
 7 **it -- it would be --**
 8 A. Yes.
 9 **Q. -- who it is now.**
 10 **Would it be reasonable for the**
 11 **Republican members of the legislature to think**
 12 **that creating two opportunity districts would be**
 13 **creating two opportunities for Democrats to have**
 14 **seats in Congress?**
 15 A. No. Because the opportunity district
 16 still is majority white. It's -- so I don't think
 17 that they would think that, knowing the general
 18 makeup of the parties. I don't think that that
 19 would be, you know --
 20 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 21 A. -- at all. It's just an opportunity.
 22 **Q. But your review of the reports of how**
 23 **those -- the performance reports convinced you**



Page 93

1 that the black candidate of choice more likely
2 than not would win in those two opportunity
3 districts; is that correct? That was your
4 previous testimony?

5 A. Well, I would just say this, that I would
6 think that they would have at least in an
7 opportunity district a 50-50 chance in that
8 district. I would think it would be a little
9 higher than 50-50, naturally, in 7. But in that
10 district. And there again, the basis for that
11 would be also the functionality report.

12 Q. Uh-huh.

13 A. You know, just because you draw and call
14 it --

15 Q. Yeah.

16 A. -- something, you have to look at the
17 reports to see how they performed, and that gives
18 you a reasonable expectation of having an
19 opportunity to be able to do.

20 Q. Do you think that Republican members of
21 the legislature would be disinclined to pass a
22 plan that would give Democrats the opportunity to
23 have two seats in Congress instead of one on party

Page 94

1 politics alone?

2 A. I don't --

3 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

4 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay.

5 A. I don't -- I don't know really because
6 the concern that, you know, we have here is race
7 and African Americans --

8 Q. Uh-huh.

9 A. -- having an opportunity to elect, you
10 know, candidates of their choice. I think that's
11 the key element here. It's not -- you know, it's
12 not the party per se.

13 Q. Right.

14 A. Yeah, this is -- it's not party driven.
15 You know, I just think that it's -- even though
16 members are -- you know, the natural majority are
17 African Americans at this time in the Democratic
18 party. But remember once upon a time they were in
19 the Republican party. Another time, you know, it
20 was -- so it's -- that's why I said it's not the
21 politics. It's the opportunity.

22 Q. Yeah.

23 A. When the opportunity existed back then,

Page 95

1 it was in the Republican party, and that's where
2 African Americans were trying to seek the
3 opportunity to have representation. So that's it
4 more than just the political party.

5 Q. Did any member of the legislature tell
6 you or communicate to you in any way that they did
7 not want to create -- excuse me -- they did not
8 want to enact a plan with two opportunity
9 districts because of race as opposed to politics?

10 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

11 Go ahead.

12 A. I can't recall verbally them saying it
13 for either way.

14 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay.

15 A. I don't even think I had that
16 conversation.

17 Q. With any --

18 A. I can't recall having that conversation
19 with anybody, you know.

20 Q. Now, of course, y'all, through the
21 strangeness of this litigation, sat out the
22 Allen v. Milligan lawsuit. But did -- are you
23 aware that went to the Supreme Court? The

Page 96

1 Milligan case did?

2 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form. We
3 didn't sit it out. That's an improper predicate.

4 MR. WALKER: Well, that's a -- that's
5 a -- you're right.

6 Q. Are you aware that the Milligan case went
7 to the Supreme Court?

8 A. I don't recall much about the -- that
9 phase of the Milligan case. I could have -- I
10 could have been told that and I could have -- you
11 know what I'm saying --

12 Q. Yeah.

13 A. -- so I'm not going to say no, I don't.
14 I don't -- I just don't recall the conversation.
15 I didn't track it, in other words, so I --

16 Q. That's fair.

17 You didn't attend oral argument in
18 Washington?

19 A. No, no. I know I didn't.

20 Q. Do you recall whether or not you made any
21 public comments about the case?

22 A. The only -- the only comments that I
23 recall -- I recall. That doesn't mean I did



Page 97

1 not -- I recall was the conversation basically
2 saying that the opportunity district on this end.

3 **Q. Uh-huh.**

4 A. -- would be a better opportunity district
5 than on that end. I think most -- most of my
6 conversations just centered around my belief that
7 this was a better plan in terms of opportunity
8 districts -- was a better opportunity than the one
9 we have. But the one we have is better than not
10 having an opportunity at all, so I support it.

11 **Q. Do you have an understanding of the**
12 **real-world impact of what the Supreme Court**
13 **decided in the Allen v. Milligan case?**

14 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

15 A. Not by memory.

16 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay.**

17 A. I'm sure, you know, that if it were
18 before me and I was reading it, I would definitely
19 have a full understanding.

20 **Q. Of course you would.**

21 **Well, let me ask you this. Did you**
22 **follow the -- well, you participated in the 2023**
23 **legislative proceedings, special session, did you**

Page 98

1 not?

2 A. I did.

3 **Q. And in the activities leading up to it?**
4 **The committee meetings.**

5 A. Yes, committee meetings. I was at
6 committee meetings.

7 **Q. Did you review the -- a number of maps**
8 **were submitted at that time. Did you review the**
9 **VRA Plaintiffs Remedial Plan?**

10 A. And what was that? VRA?

11 **Q. That was one of the plans. Do you recall**
12 **whether you reviewed it or not? Do you recall**
13 **whether you reviewed any of the remedial plans**
14 **that were submitted other than the Singleton Plan**
15 **and the Smitherman Plan?**

16 A. I looked at the -- what is that? The
17 Milligan? Is that what you just said? The
18 Milligan?

19 **Q. Well, there was the VRA Plaintiffs**
20 **Remedial Plan, the Community of Interest Plan --**

21 A. Oh, yes, I looked at the one that -- I
22 saw the plan that Senator Livingston --

23 **Q. And the Livingston Plan for 2 and 3?**

Page 99

1 A. Uh-huh. I saw his plan. I looked at it.

2 **Q. Did you speak at the legislative hearings**
3 **for the -- in connection with the 2023**
4 **redistricting, do you recall?**

5 A. I made some comments.

6 **Q. Okay.**

7 A. I did make comments.

8 **Q. And, generally, were those in preference**
9 **for a plan with two opportunity districts?**

10 A. I think it was.

11 **Q. You hadn't changed your position?**

12 A. Oh, no. No.

13 **Q. Yeah, okay.**

14 A. Not at all. Two opportunity districts.

15 **Q. And you submitted -- you submitted for**
16 **consideration in 2023 the Smitherman Plan, did you**
17 **not?**

18 A. I did.

19 **Q. Okay. What happened to that?**

20 A. It was rejected by the committee. And
21 then when I presented it on the floor as a
22 substitute, it was voted down by the majority.

23 And the committee is made up of -- the majority of

Page 100

1 people that are on the committee are members of
2 the majority party.

3 **Q. That's the way the act is written, isn't**
4 **it? Do you recall? The makeup of the -- how the**
5 **committee is made up?**

6 A. I don't recall that.

7 **Q. Okay.**

8 A. But that is how it's made up, but I don't
9 recall.

10 MR. BLACKSHER: Which committee are we
11 talking about? The reapportionment committee?

12 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Which committee were**
13 **you talking about? That voted?**

14 A. Yeah, I was talking about the -- no, the
15 standing committee. It was put in. It was put
16 confirmation.

17 **Q. Put in --**

18 A. I think it was.

19 **Q. Okay.**

20 A. It was the committee it was put in that
21 we had debate about the plans is what I was
22 talking about. That committee rejected it. And
23 so it was not moved on to be considered on the



Senator Rodger Smitherman

101..104

Page 101

1 special order calendar. And then when we got on
 2 the floor, we offered it as a substitute.
 3 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) And the substitute was**
 4 **rejected?**
 5 A. It was rejected.
 6 (Defendant's Exhibit 2 was marked
 7 for identification and copy of
 8 same is attached hereto.)
 9 **Q. Let me show you what I've marked as**
 10 **Exhibit 2. And if you'll turn to the back of it,**
 11 **this is -- this is Document 242-5 from 1536,**
 12 **Exhibit 5, the 2023 Plan.**
 13 **Do you recognize this as the Enacted**
 14 **Plan, the 2023 Plan?**
 15 A. The best to my knowledge, I do.
 16 **Q. I'll represent to you that it is.**
 17 A. Okay.
 18 **Q. Okay.**
 19 MR. BLACKSHER: For the record, the
 20 docket numbers you are citing are in the Caster
 21 action.
 22 MR. WALKER: Yeah, 1536.
 23 **Q. What did you think of this map?**

Page 102

1 A. I thought this map gerrymandered
 2 Jefferson County. Split us up. And the same --
 3 you know, without being repetitive to all the
 4 things that I said to you previously about that, I
 5 would just embrace those again.
 6 **Q. Okay.**
 7 A. You know, that it just -- it does us a
 8 very just injustice in terms of the way that it
 9 splits us up. In particular, as I said, if you
 10 look at the count, and you look at the population,
 11 those areas of the county, you clearly will see
 12 that that's race, you know, on the bottom.
 13 Majority of that are predominantly African
 14 Americans on the bottom part.
 15 **Q. So is it fair to say that you believe the**
 16 **part of CD-7 in the 2023 Plan that is in Jefferson**
 17 **County is a racial gerrymander?**
 18 A. I think that splitting the county is a
 19 racial gerrymander.
 20 **Q. Okay. What about the split in**
 21 **Tuscaloosa? That's different from the split in**
 22 **the 2021 Plan. Do you have an opinion as to**
 23 **whether or not that's a racial gerrymander?**

Page 103

1 A. I think it is.
 2 **Q. Okay.**
 3 A. I think it is.
 4 **Q. And have you looked at any precincts to**
 5 **see whether it is or do you have any evidential**
 6 **basis for that?**
 7 A. Just -- I haven't looked specifically at
 8 the inside of those precincts. But it's just my
 9 general -- first of all, just my general knowledge
 10 of those areas and who lives there.
 11 **Q. Okay.**
 12 A. I know where you take Tuscaloosa and
 13 you're down there where you've got Central High
 14 School, you know. Or Paul Bryant. You know,
 15 that's predominantly African American schools.
 16 Those neighborhoods are predominantly African
 17 American in that area.
 18 **Q. What about the split up there in**
 19 **Lauderdale County? Do you have any reason to**
 20 **believe that is along racial lines?**
 21 A. I don't know either way.
 22 **Q. Okay. What about the split in Talladega**
 23 **County? Do you have any reason to believe that's**

Page 104

1 **along racial lines?**
 2 A. Let me see where that is.
 3 **Q. Let me show you right here, sir. See**
 4 **right here down at this little -- down in the**
 5 **corner here?**
 6 A. Oh. Okay. Talladega.
 7 I don't know. I don't know.
 8 **Q. What about the split in Elmore County?**
 9 **Do you have any reason to believe that's along**
 10 **racial lines?**
 11 A. Elmore? Elmore? In this district -- let
 12 me ask you a question if you can answer that.
 13 **Q. Okay.**
 14 A. In this district, the opportunity
 15 district is what? 2?
 16 **Q. Yes.**
 17 A. Yes, I would think that that would be
 18 split on racial lines. I don't have any proof,
 19 you know, sitting here.
 20 **Q. But --**
 21 A. But I would think that it would be.
 22 **Q. I answered your question wrong. This --**
 23 **scratch that.**

ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 105

1 Look at Covington County. Do you see --
2 there's a split there. Do you have any reason to
3 believe that that is along racial lines?

4 A. No, I don't have any.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. I don't know that area well enough to --

7 Q. Okay. Do you have an opinion as to the
8 role that politics played in the drawing of this
9 map?

10 A. I could -- let me -- the best way I can
11 answer you is this way. I can't see why politics
12 should have played a role in here.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. When you got 27 people. I keep saying
15 that. That's -- 27? You can cut off filibuster
16 at 21. You could get what you want with 18.

17 Q. Right.

18 A. And still have 7, 8, or 9 to spare. So
19 there's no reason for the majority to interject
20 politics into it to that level, to that degree.

21 Q. So the Republicans have a, I guess your
22 point is, a supermajority in the senate?

23 A. Yes.

Page 106

1 Q. But with regard to drawing new
2 congressional plans, would you agree that the
3 Republicans have an interest in drawing as few
4 Democratic districts as they can?

5 A. Well, my answer to that is they would
6 have an interest, I think -- well, these districts
7 reflected their -- I won't say their interest.
8 Reflected what they did.

9 Q. Uh-huh.

10 A. They drew as few as black people in their
11 districts as they could.

12 Q. Uh-huh. Would you expect that a
13 legislature controlled by Republicans would have
14 an interest in creating fewer Democratic
15 congressional seats if that were an option for it?
16 Would that be, in your experience for you as a
17 legislator, a consideration that one party would
18 have in not creating seats for the other party in
19 Congress if they could?

20 A. Well, under our situation, which, after
21 the 2010 --

22 Q. Uh-huh.

23 A. -- districts, I would think that that

Page 107

1 wouldn't be a consideration because they won
2 decisively and took over the legislature on
3 districts that the majority Democrats drew. So
4 they got the majority on districts we drew. So it
5 was -- those districts were very successful --

6 Q. Yeah.

7 A. -- for their election. So I don't see
8 any concern from the political standpoint when you
9 take those districts and you -- you know, you get
10 that large a number out of districts that you
11 didn't draw.

12 Q. Right.

13 A. Then there's no concern about -- I won't
14 say there's no concern. There shouldn't be any
15 concern about from a politics standpoint because,
16 you know, these districts are very successful as
17 they are.

18 Q. Right.

19 A. As they were then --

20 Q. Right.

21 A. -- for them.

22 Q. But we're not talking about redrawing the
23 legislative districts. I'm talking about

Page 108

1 redrawing the Congressional districts. And just
2 really the question I'd ask you pretty simply is
3 would you agree that whoever's in charge -- let's
4 say one party is in charge of the legislature --
5 that they have an interest in minimizing
6 representation of the other party in the national
7 Congress?

8 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

9 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) When they do
10 redistricting?

11 In other words, if the Democrats are in
12 power, they have an interest at least in thinking
13 about minimizing how many Republicans they send to
14 the Congress. And if the Republicans are in power
15 in the legislature, they have an interest at least
16 in thinking about minimizing how many Democrats
17 they send to the national Congress. Would you
18 agree with that?

19 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

20 Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) That's just politics;
21 right?

22 A. Well, I would say this, is that -- is
23 that race can't be a factor no matter what that



Page 109

1 interest is there.

2 **Q. Uh-huh.**

3 A. And that's the concern that I have; that
4 race, you know, was a factor or is a factor or
5 would be a factor or that is a factor in terms of
6 making -- approaching it from the question that
7 you asked me.

8 **Q. Uh-huh.**

9 A. So, you know, and the numbers even in the
10 past, you know, districts that were drawn speaks
11 for itself. As I said, when you've got
12 65 percent --

13 **Q. Right.**

14 A. -- 70 percent black folks packed in one
15 district, you know, that's -- that's race. It
16 doesn't take -- it didn't take -- it doesn't take
17 65 percent. It doesn't take 70 percent. It
18 doesn't take 62 percent, you know, to be able to
19 accomplish whatever other ends that you may or may
20 not be trying to reach. So it's -- so that's
21 where you have to -- I have to assume and my
22 perception is that race was an issue because of
23 such large, as the words we normally use, stacking

Page 110

1 and packing. You know, I mean, that's --

2 **Q. Uh-huh.**

3 A. -- it speaks for itself.

4 **Q. Do you have an opinion as to whether or**
5 **not it's legitimate for the legislature to**
6 **consider political goals when it draws**
7 **Congressional districts?**

8 A. Not over the rights of voters, individual
9 voters, no. That's our constitutional right.
10 That's a constitutional right of people, you know,
11 to have that opportunity to vote and get the
12 person they want.

13 When we start -- the question that you
14 asked -- you know, that you asked, my perception
15 of the question is that's political and party.
16 Over here, it's constitutional. And that's the
17 key element, that this is a guaranteed right by
18 national Constitution. This is just party rules
19 or party desires, whether it be Republican or
20 Democrat. That's just party rules. And that's
21 not -- that's not our, lack of better word, it's
22 not our statutes. This is just a concern of
23 different parties. You know, we have something

Page 111

1 similar like that going on right now, you know,
2 with the election, the changing of people and the
3 people complaining because you change -- one
4 party's changing and they got this other person.
5 But as I myself say -- you know, and I'm not
6 saying I know everything, but I know I'm a
7 constitutional law professor for about 25 years.

8 **Q. Right.**

9 A. And that's a political question. That's
10 the party. Even though you got folks on the
11 other -- "We going to do this." But in reality,
12 those issues are more akin to a party and it's
13 not -- it's not the Constitution. It's not the
14 law. You know, over here that right for, you
15 know, minorities and blacks to have an opportunity
16 to, as we say, in an opportunity district to elect
17 a person, that's a constitutional issue.

18 **Q. Do you have any evidence that you can**
19 **tell us -- let me back up. Scratch that.**

20 **Did any member of the legislature**
21 **communicate to you in any way -- email, text,**
22 **speaking to you, however -- that he or she voted**
23 **for the 2023 Plan, what I've shown to you as**

Page 112

1 **Defendant's Exhibit 2, because of race?**

2 A. I don't recall having a conversation
3 regarding that directly with anyone.

4 **Q. Okay.**

5 A. I'm not saying if I did or didn't. I
6 don't recall having one.

7 **Q. Is it appropriate for the legislature to**
8 **consider population when it does redistricting?**

9 A. What you mean by consider population? I
10 know population means people and numbers.

11 **Q. People -- oh, I know.**

12 A. But what in particular about population?
13 Was there something particular?

14 **Q. Well, how many people live here as**
15 **opposed to here. I mean --**

16 A. We've got to get a certain number. I
17 mean, within a deviation of the -- you know,
18 this -- I think this is zero deviation we talked
19 about here.

20 **Q. Yeah.**

21 A. In the past, we've had, you know, a small
22 percentage of deviation.

23 **Q. Right.**



Senator Rodger Smitherman

113..116

Page 113

1 A. But I think within that realm, whatever
 2 the rules are set, whether it's zero deviation or
 3 whether it's plus/minus 2 percent, 1 percent --
 4 **Q. Yeah.**
 5 A. -- whatever you have to to get those
 6 numbers, yes.
 7 **Q. And with regard to constitutional,**
 8 **despite your counsel's arguments, the legislature**
 9 **has always understood that there should be no**
 10 **deviation, minimal deviation; is that correct?**
 11 A. No. We've gone as high as 5 percent.
 12 Remember I've been --
 13 **Q. In congressional?**
 14 A. Oh, no, no, no, no, no.
 15 **Q. Yeah. I'm sorry.**
 16 A. I'm sorry.
 17 **Q. I was referring to -- yeah.**
 18 A. No, no. Not in congressional, no.
 19 **Q. Yeah.**
 20 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form. Improper
 21 predicate.
 22 A. But I think that one of the things
 23 that -- you know, race shouldn't be a factor. And

Page 114

1 I'll just give you an idea. I mean, you take --
 2 when I started out representing Homewood, I was --
 3 my line was Valley Avenue. And then when we came
 4 back for reapportionment, because I had to add
 5 some additional people --
 6 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Uh-huh.**
 7 A. -- we just picked up the line and moved
 8 it all the way down to Hollywood Boulevard.
 9 90 percent -- I won't say 90 percent.
 10 **Q. Yeah.**
 11 A. The vast majority of those people were
 12 Republicans and they were white voters. So race
 13 had nothing to do with it. It's just when you're
 14 getting those numbers, I just picked up the line
 15 and moved it down there. You know, I wasn't
 16 looking at -- you know, looking at was it white or
 17 black or anything like that. It's just that you
 18 don't. You know, you just look -- you don't let
 19 race be your dominant --
 20 **Q. Understand.**
 21 A. Yeah. Yeah. Regardless in my case
 22 whether it reduced my percentage from 52 to 50.
 23 You know, I mean, that's not the factor you look

Page 115

1 at.
 2 **Q. You felt certain that you could win**
 3 **whatever the adjustment was; is that correct?**
 4 A. Well, I was -- I was going to run. I
 5 can't say for certain. You know how voters are.
 6 You don't never know --
 7 **Q. No, I don't. You do, but I don't.**
 8 A. But I was --
 9 **Q. Well, let me ask you another question.**
 10 **Do you think that when the legislature draws**
 11 **districts, it should take into consideration the**
 12 **address of the incumbent?**
 13 A. I don't -- I don't know necessarily that
 14 you need to do that. I mean, because, you know,
 15 you look at the congressional map we're operating
 16 under now.
 17 **Q. Yeah.**
 18 A. Two incumbents will happen to be into the
 19 same district. You can't make that the dominant
 20 factor in your decision of drawing the district
 21 whether or not you want to do that. Just it
 22 can't -- that can't be the factor because that's
 23 not the controlling factor. The controlling

Page 116

1 factor in this case --
 2 **Q. Yeah.**
 3 A. -- and what we're talking about now is
 4 the opportunities for African Americans to elect a
 5 candidate of their choice.
 6 **Q. Would you vote for a senate plan that**
 7 **paired you with another senator?**
 8 A. Yes, if it was the proper plan. You
 9 know, if the plan met all the muster and
 10 requirements --
 11 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 12 A. -- and then -- yeah, I would. I mean,
 13 I --
 14 **Q. Even if it paired you with another**
 15 **senator?**
 16 A. Because -- yes, because it ain't going to
 17 make no difference if the folk want somebody else.
 18 It don't have to be another senator. It could be
 19 a House member. It could be just somebody who
 20 running. So, you know, I don't know that that's
 21 the controlling factor. The factor is going to be
 22 what kind of performance that I have done over the
 23 last four years, whether it be an incumbent I'm

ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 117

1 running against, whether it be a new person, or
2 somebody else, so.

3 **Q. Is there a value to voters in having an**
4 **amount of stability in their district? And we**
5 **talked earlier about the value to voters in having**
6 **a long-term representative like you, somebody that**
7 **they can get to know and be comfortable with. Do**
8 **you recall that conversation we had earlier?**

9 A. I remember we had some conversation about
10 that.

11 **Q. So is there a value to voters in having a**
12 **district that remains stable if possible and where**
13 **the boundaries change, you know, as much as they**
14 **need to correct for population but otherwise don't**
15 **change much? Is there a value to voters in that?**

16 A. Well, I would think the value would be
17 having somebody who represented what your
18 interests or concerns, not necessarily somebody
19 who been sitting there for 10, 15, or 20 years and
20 yet you don't have -- you're not represented, you
21 don't a chance to have those issues put before.
22 And I -- you know, I can tell you we, in our
23 process, you know, there are some areas that you

Page 118

1 have African Americans who live in those areas,
2 and I'll just say this. I don't see their
3 interests being presented and fought for in our --
4 in the senate. You know, I mean, you got people
5 there who are trying to help those people who --

6 **Q. Uh-huh.**

7 A. -- they're not necessarily the legislator
8 in that district because that person is not
9 fighting that battle for them. So I think that's
10 why I say it's more important to have somebody
11 there who's going to speak up for you than just
12 somebody that say that they been there for a
13 while, you know, the name and that kind of thing.

14 **Q. Do you know what a -- I know you do.**
15 **What's a community of interest, Senator**
16 **Smitherman?**

17 A. Well, a community of interest is
18 communities who have a -- like desires, like
19 needs, who want similar representation, who not
20 necessarily think alike in everything, but they
21 have similar thoughts and beliefs in how things
22 ought to be done and what should be done.

23 **Q. What is the community of interest that**

Page 119

1 **your district represents, if any? Or communities**
2 **of interest? Your Senate district?**

3 A. Well, communities of interest, number one
4 would be education. Number two would be
5 opportunities for employment. It would be
6 opportunities for housing; you know, to actually
7 own a home -- home ownership. Because when you're
8 in an urban area, you have a lot of apartments.
9 People want homes. Health, a community of
10 interest that we -- you know, we have great health
11 facilities, and we do have good ones here. And,
12 of course, crime. You know, crime.

13 **Q. Sure.**

14 A. So those would be some of the communities
15 of interest.

16 **Q. Look at the 2023 map --**

17 A. This one?

18 **Q. -- please. I think that's it. Turn**
19 **to --**

20 A. Number 5?

21 **Q. Number -- yeah.**

22 A. That's it. I see. That's it. Because
23 you got 2023 on the other side.

Page 120

1 **Q. That's right. Yeah. And I've got this**
2 **one marked wrong. Sorry. Let me find my copy.**
3 **Here it is.**

4 **Are there any communities of interest in**
5 **that map, the 2023 map, that you think should have**
6 **been kept together but were not?**

7 A. Yes. Jefferson County.

8 **Q. Jefferson County?**

9 A. In particular. Yeah.

10 **Q. Okay. Any others?**

11 A. Well, Tuscaloosa. As best they could.
12 Tuscaloosa should have been kept together as best
13 they could as well.

14 **Q. Is Tuscaloosa as a whole a community of**
15 **interest, do you know?**

16 A. I don't know that much about them.

17 **Q. Okay.**

18 A. You know, I know about them due to other
19 activities being down there, you know, but I don't
20 know -- know it to that degree.

21 **Q. Is there a racial community of interest**
22 **in Jefferson County?**

23 A. What does that mean?



Page 121

1 **Q. Is there a community of interest of black**
 2 **people as distinct -- in Jefferson County as**
 3 **distinct from white people in Jefferson County?**

4 A. I would say that there are various
 5 issues --

6 **Q. Uh-huh.**

7 A. -- that may vary. And I think that you
 8 may have a -- certain issues. But not -- not
 9 necessarily a community of interest is just based
 10 on race.

11 **Q. Yeah.**

12 A. Not here. I mean, because of the
 13 diversity of this county, the diversity of the
 14 district I represent. As I said earlier, this
 15 county is a clear -- how should I put it? You
 16 know how you have like a model home? You have a
 17 model example of how it ought to be.

18 **Q. Right.**

19 A. This county is model example --

20 **Q. I get you.**

21 A. -- of how it ought to be with folks
 22 living together --

23 **Q. I get it.**

Page 122

1 A. -- and being open-minded about each
 2 other.

3 **Q. You said there might be a few things**
 4 **where there was a difference. What would those**
 5 **be? Between the interests of the black citizens**
 6 **of Jefferson County and the white citizens of**
 7 **Jefferson County -- if I understood your response.**

8 A. Oh, just maybe in the needs in those
 9 communities. You know, just basic needs,
 10 physiological needs and things of that nature.
 11 And, you know, having someone there who would
 12 speak up for you for those individual needs and
 13 what-not. That's why it's important to have the,
 14 you know, representative of your choice. Someone
 15 asked -- that's as I said earlier about I have to
 16 speak up even for areas in this state that's
 17 nowhere near the district I represent because
 18 those people won't speak up for them and they
 19 represent them.

20 **Q. What are some of those areas that you**
 21 **feel called upon to speak up for because they're**
 22 **not being represented properly?**

23 A. Well, when I say not represented

Page 123

1 properly, I'm saying not having the opportunity to
 2 get the resources and they need additional
 3 assistance.

4 **Q. Okay.**

5 A. And it varies. I mean, you've got a
 6 Black Belt.

7 **Q. Uh-huh.**

8 A. Or you take Montgomery. I'll just give
 9 you a clear example. Worked hard with helping
 10 them get the water thing, you know, they got.

11 **Q. Right.**

12 A. You know, those -- that's why I say
 13 helping other areas that need somebody to speak up
 14 to help them. You know, some of them don't have
 15 that kind of representation and you have to -- you
 16 know, in my case, you just have to do the best you
 17 can to try to help them.

18 **Q. Do you have any information about what**
 19 **was the intent of the legislature in drawing the**
 20 **2023 map?**

21 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

22 A. You mean this map right here?

23 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Yes, sir.**

Page 124

1 A. This one here?

2 **Q. Yes, sir.**

3 A. No, I don't -- I don't know what the
 4 majority's intent was because I think that we very
 5 clearly expressed our concerns about this district
 6 and about splitting counties and about, you know,
 7 desires for the opportunity district and the
 8 functionality of, you know, of drawing those
 9 districts and providing those opportunities.

10 So I don't know. After telling them
 11 that -- after telling them that or sharing that
 12 with them and nothing different was done, I don't
 13 know what their intent because they didn't move
 14 off the needle. That's just the best way I can
 15 say it to you.

16 You know, they understood what the
 17 concerns were and the needs and our desires, but
 18 it didn't move them off the needle at all, you
 19 know. So I don't know what their intents were,
 20 you know, based on that.

21 In fact, that's -- you know, it was the
 22 same thing with our committee. I was -- I was
 23 just kind of disappointed that the committee



Page 125

Page 127

1 didn't sit down prior -- and I'm talking the
2 reapportionment committee.

3 **Q. Uh-huh.**

4 A. -- prior to submitting that map and at
5 least let's have a meeting and go over the pros
6 and cons and -- and, you know, about what was
7 going to take place. But the reapportionment
8 committee never had that kind of meeting. So we
9 didn't have an opportunity to address that until
10 you got to committee.

11 **Q. Uh-huh.**

12 A. And on those committees, everybody on
13 reapportionment wasn't necessarily on those
14 committees. So you didn't even have the full
15 committee that voted for the bill to be moved from
16 the, you know, committee process to the overall
17 floor.

18 (Defendant's Exhibit 3 was marked
19 for identification and copy of
20 same is attached hereto.)

21 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Let me show you what**
22 **I've marked as Defendant's Exhibit 3. And that's,**
23 **I'll represent to you, the Remedial Plan 3, the**

1 A. That we're -- that they're running under
2 right now?

3 **Q. Yes, sir.**

4 A. Okay.

5 **Q. Is there anything about this map that you**
6 **don't like?**

7 A. Well, I -- just Jefferson County being
8 split. That's my primary concern. They way we're
9 split up like that.

10 **Q. Anything else?**

11 A. Similar concerns, you know, with
12 Tuscaloosa, as I mentioned. But what I do like is
13 that it does give us an opportunity district.
14 It's the one if I -- yeah, I got it right. It's
15 the opportunity. Does give us an opportunity
16 district.

17 I don't -- you know, I think that the
18 plan that Senator Singleton put forward and I did
19 too does a better job of keeping the Black Belt
20 together.

21 **Q. Uh-huh.**

22 A. So those would be the only things about
23 that. But I -- you know, I'm still in favor of

Page 126

Page 128

1 **Court-Ordered Plan. And this is, I believe, an**
2 **extract from the second amended complaint.**

3 **Do you recognize that as the**
4 **Court-Ordered Plan?**

5 A. It resembles -- I don't -- I don't
6 necessarily -- I will accept that, but I don't --
7 that it is. But I don't recognize it to the point
8 to see the -- to point to the small
9 distinctions --

10 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Fair enough.**

11 A. Yes.

12 **Q. It's hard to keep them straight; I agree.**
13 **With you.**

14 MR. BLACKSHER: Dorman, this is -- you
15 said it was from the second amended complaint?

16 MR. WALKER: Am I wrong on that?

17 MR. BLACKSHER: Yeah. It's -- in
18 Milligan. In the Milligan docket number.

19 MR. WALKER: You're right. Okay.

20 **Q. Anyway, it's the Remedial Plan Number 3,**
21 **which --**

22 A. Is this the plan we're under now?

23 **Q. That is the plan we're under now.**

1 this plan.

2 **Q. The complaint says that you live in**
3 **Congressional District 7 under this plan. Is that**
4 **correct?**

5 A. Yes, I do.

6 **Q. Okay. Okay. Does this map provided the**
7 **relief that you wanted in filing the lawsuit?**

8 A. Not all of it.

9 **Q. Okay.**

10 A. Not all of it. Because of the
11 constitutional issues with the whole county. And,
12 of course, you still, you know, got the
13 possibility of some gerrymandering in there.

14 **Q. And what do you understand to be the**
15 **constitutional issue involving whole counties?**

16 A. Well, we're supposed to keep the counties
17 whole as possible. And in terms of the
18 communities of interest, in terms of its
19 boundaries, that we'll make an effort to do that.
20 And we showed with the plans that we present it
21 can be done.

22 **Q. Uh-huh.**

23 A. That's the key thing. We showed it could



Page 129

1 be done. And in showing that, you know, the fact
2 that they take it your primary focus is providing
3 that all counties are whole --

4 **Q. Uh-huh.**

5 A. -- as many as you can without any
6 interruption or deviation from its boundaries.

7 **Q. When you refer to a constitutional**
8 **requirement to keep counties whole, is that**
9 **requirement in the federal Constitution or in the**
10 **state Constitution?**

11 A. I would -- I'm not certain if it's in
12 one -- which one specifically or both.

13 **Q. Uh-huh.**

14 A. Because I'm under oath, and I just don't
15 want say -- to be inaccurate.

16 **Q. Yes.**

17 A. So -- but, you know, I could easily as
18 you -- you probably would, I guess, smile and say
19 that give me about ten minutes and I could
20 research it. That's right.

21 **Q. That's fine.**

22 **If Alabama has two Congressional**
23 **districts in which black voters can elect their**

Page 130

1 **candidate of choice, would that plan address your**
2 **concerns even if you did not happen to live in one**
3 **of those districts?**

4 A. It would address most of my concerns, but
5 it couldn't address all of them because I want to
6 keep Jefferson County whole.

7 **Q. Okay. That's --**

8 A. That's -- you know, I think that it
9 should be whole. And I've given you my reasons
10 why, you know, without --

11 **Q. You have.**

12 A. -- without saying it.

13 **Q. Is it a goal of yours in this litigation**
14 **to get a second Democrat elected to Congress?**

15 A. No. My goal is just to have a second
16 opportunity that, you know, the voters,
17 particularly African American voters, can elect
18 the person of their choice. Just have an
19 opportunity. It's not a guarantee. But --

20 **Q. I know.**

21 A. -- every good reasonable opportunity
22 considering the makeup -- you know, the
23 percentages in the district, considering the

Page 131

1 functionality study of how people vote, you know,
2 and all those other factors that we stressed were
3 our concerns.

4 **Q. If Alabama can draw a Congressional**
5 **district with a black majority -- do you believe**
6 **that if Alabama can draw a Congressional district**
7 **with a black majority, it should do that?**

8 A. Well, I -- not at the risk of not having
9 an opportunity district as well.

10 **Q. Okay.**

11 A. And I think it can be done and we have an
12 opportunity district as well. We can't have
13 the -- it won't be the 65 or 70 percent --

14 **Q. No.**

15 A. -- but I think that we could do that,
16 especially, once again, you look at the
17 functionality studies.

18 **Q. Do you know Representative Sewell?**

19 A. I do.

20 **Q. Have you contacted her about issues**
21 **related to your neighborhood or your community or**
22 **anything like that?**

23 A. No, because most of them I take care of

Page 132

1 myself.

2 **Q. That's the advantage of being a senator?**

3 A. Yeah, I take care of them myself most --
4 I try to, anyway, with my colleagues' help. Now,
5 I don't want anybody thinking I do it all by
6 myself. I don't. They have to help me. But with
7 their help.

8 **Q. Do you have any information -- do you**
9 **know what a racial appeal in a campaign is?**

10 A. Uh-huh.

11 **Q. Do you have any information about racial**
12 **appeals or appeals to race being made in political**
13 **campaigns in Alabama?**

14 A. Oh, oh. Now I know what you're saying.

15 **Q. Okay.**

16 A. Running a race-based campaign.

17 **Q. Yeah.**

18 A. That's what you -- am I correct, what I'm
19 saying?

20 **Q. Yes, sir.**

21 A. Oh, we got a history in this state, you
22 know, of doing that.

23 **Q. Yeah.**



Senator Rodger Smitherman

133..136

Page 133

1 A. And, you know, I mean, it's --
 2 remember -- what his name? Willie Brown or Willie
 3 Horton or whichever one --
 4 **Q. Willie Horton. Yes.**
 5 A. Yeah. So I mean, we -- we go way back
 6 with --
 7 **Q. Was that Dukakis?**
 8 A. I don't know.
 9 **Q. I mean, I remember it --**
 10 A. But I know we --
 11 **Q. Yeah.**
 12 A. We had a similar situation in this state.
 13 If you -- you may or may not recall back -- it was
 14 back several years ago that we -- we were showing
 15 pictures of some of these candidates. I can't
 16 remember the race. But it was a -- on the
 17 commercials and the ads. And, you know, it's -- I
 18 can't -- you know, I can't recall them, but I'm
 19 going to say it this way. You know, it's -- we
 20 have -- there are code words that people
 21 understand that they are talking about race.
 22 Let me just share this to you and -- you
 23 didn't ask me, but I'm going to just share it with

Page 134

1 you.
 2 **Q. Okay.**
 3 A. I'm a product of segregation and
 4 integration.
 5 **Q. Yeah.**
 6 A. We're the -- we are the ones who
 7 integrated at age 17, the first integration from
 8 Jim Crow. So I know -- I know it when I see it.
 9 That's the best way I can tell you.
 10 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 11 A. I -- you are looking at the ones who
 12 integrated right here.
 13 **Q. Right. Yes.**
 14 A. And so I know as I sit here, I know what
 15 I see.
 16 **Q. Yeah.**
 17 A. You know.
 18 **Q. If you can, what was the last political**
 19 **campaign in Alabama that you can recall for which**
 20 **you thought there was a racial appeal or code**
 21 **words or anything like that?**
 22 A. I'd have to go back and think.
 23 **Q. Okay.**

Page 135

1 A. I just can't call up.
 2 **Q. That's fine.**
 3 A. You know, because I want to be accurate
 4 when I say. I can't call that up right now.
 5 **Q. I've got some questions here asking you**
 6 **about when you registered to vote and all that.**
 7 **But I'm fairly certain you're registered to vote.**
 8 A. I am.
 9 **Q. So we're going to skip over that.**
 10 **Are you aware of anybody in recent**
 11 **history to your knowledge having difficulty**
 12 **registering to vote in Alabama?**
 13 A. Well, I don't know people's specific
 14 names, but I'm aware of people not being able to
 15 get to where they need to to register to vote.
 16 They need some help and some assistance. You
 17 know, and --
 18 **Q. Getting to register?**
 19 A. Getting to register or getting the
 20 information there. They need some help with
 21 understanding --
 22 **Q. Okay.**
 23 A. -- just how they need to fill that out.

Page 136

1 And, of course, you know, if you've been -- you're
 2 not charged to --
 3 **Q. Yeah.**
 4 A. -- but if you've been keeping up with
 5 what's been happening with us in the legislature,
 6 we've just made that considerably more difficult
 7 in the fact that you can't hire anybody to go help
 8 somebody go do something. It's got to be strictly
 9 voluntary. And that in itself is -- you know, is
 10 a big ask to ask people in these hundred degrees,
 11 just kind of go out there on your own. Some
 12 people do, but it's fewer people that would do
 13 that because now, you can't hire people to go out
 14 to do stuff like that.
 15 **Q. Right. And you're referring to -- I**
 16 **can't think of the name of the law, but it was a**
 17 **law that was passed in the last session that**
 18 **relates to handling of absentee ballots and**
 19 **assisting people with casting a vote?**
 20 A. That's correct.
 21 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.
 22 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Is all your family**
 23 **registered to vote?**



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Senator Rodger Smitherman

137..140

Page 137

Page 139

1 A. Yes.
 2 **Q. And I'm going to assume just because it's**
 3 **you, but I'll ask anyway. Do you vote in all**
 4 **elections?**
 5 A. Yes.
 6 **Q. Okay. Primary?**
 7 A. Yes.
 8 **Q. General?**
 9 A. Yes.
 10 **Q. Runoff?**
 11 A. Yes.
 12 **Q. Special?**
 13 A. Yes.
 14 **Q. Where is your polling place?**
 15 A. 6th Avenue Baptist Church.
 16 **Q. Is that?**
 17 A. The one across the street from Elmwood
 18 Cemetery.
 19 **Q. Okay. Is that for federal, state, and**
 20 **municipal?**
 21 A. I think that's right.
 22 **Q. Okay.**
 23 A. I think that's the only place I have been

1 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 2 A. I'm a believer in diversity.
 3 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 4 A. Everybody ought to have an opportunity.
 5 Fair opportunity.
 6 And, of course, you know, how well
 7 they -- their position on crime.
 8 **Q. How well, in your view, has the**
 9 **legislature done recently in supporting education?**
 10 A. I think that -- I won't talk about
 11 prospective forward. I'll just talk about right
 12 at this moment now?
 13 **Q. Right at this moment?**
 14 A. I don't think that we've done the best
 15 job that we could do in supporting public
 16 education.
 17 **Q. Give -- give --**
 18 A. And public education brings in urban,
 19 particularly a lot of urban -- and rural
 20 education. But it brings in a lot of minority
 21 students.
 22 **Q. Right.**
 23 A. We don't -- we haven't provided equitable

Page 138

Page 140

1 going.
 2 **Q. Is that a convenient place for you to**
 3 **vote?**
 4 A. It is.
 5 **Q. Okay. Any trouble voting there?**
 6 A. No.
 7 **Q. Have you ever voted absentee in Alabama?**
 8 A. I can't recall.
 9 **Q. Okay.**
 10 A. I can't recall.
 11 **Q. When you decide which candidate you**
 12 **personally support, is race a significant**
 13 **consideration?**
 14 A. The issues. The issues. Their position.
 15 **Q. Race is not?**
 16 A. Uh-huh. Their position on the issues is
 17 my concern.
 18 **Q. What are the issues that drive your**
 19 **selection of a candidate?**
 20 A. Well, number one is how well they support
 21 education. How well they support public
 22 education. How well they support job creation.
 23 How well they support diversity.

1 resources to those urban people and to the
 2 minority district -- minority school districts
 3 that need that. And -- because the economics are
 4 not equal in all communities in this state.
 5 So just to have a process where you say
 6 10 -- I might have said this earlier. Where you
 7 have 10 mills, you know, and then that sounds good
 8 on paper, but 10 mills will produce, this
 9 system -- I'm just going to pick an amount.
 10 **Q. Yeah.**
 11 A. \$100. 10 mills -- same difference. That
 12 10 mills produce this system \$160.
 13 That's the problem. And so actually,
 14 this past legislative session, I put in a bill.
 15 We have 206 -- I could be wrong. Give or take one
 16 or two -- schools that are failing schools.
 17 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 18 A. I put in a bill that would provide that
 19 we give each one of those schools \$1 million
 20 upfront now. That's \$206 million.
 21 And I took that because I've modeled the
 22 approach of helping those schools behind Governor
 23 Ivey. You remember she had those -- I forgot what



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 141

1 it's called. Those -- not -- where she had 15
 2 schools --
 3 **Q. Right.**
 4 A. -- and she provided a million dollars for
 5 each one of them.
 6 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 7 A. Two of them are in my district.
 8 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 9 A. Center Street and Hayes. And that money
 10 rose those -- because you could get the help, the
 11 aides and all that. It brought those schools from
 12 being failing schools up out of it.
 13 So she's already set the predicate.
 14 **Q. Yeah.**
 15 A. And I followed her predicate for 206
 16 schools.
 17 Well, I met resistance. And that's what
 18 I meant. And a lot of those schools --
 19 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 20 A. -- Most of them are in urban areas, would
 21 affect African Americans and poor people in the
 22 rural areas.
 23 Now, as a result of that, we're

Page 142

1 beginning to meet now. So it took that whole
 2 session to get everybody on board to try to make
 3 some adjustments -- although I think my plan is
 4 the best one -- to give them that money under some
 5 supervision. But we are meeting now and in
 6 August getting ready to have another meeting.
 7 I was fortunate enough to be on the
 8 foundation, creation of the Foundation Program.
 9 **Q. Oh, good. Okay.**
 10 A. See. So I'm one of the pioneers.
 11 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 12 A. That, you know, Governor Fob James
 13 selected me --
 14 **Q. Just tell the Court briefly what the**
 15 **Foundation Program did.**
 16 A. It's the funding for education. Per
 17 pupil. Based on the student population.
 18 Primarily the student population.
 19 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 20 A. There are certain pots for certain
 21 specialties but the student population itself.
 22 **Q. How was that an improvement over the**
 23 **previous funding system?**

Page 143

1 A. Well, we didn't -- we were in court --
 2 **Q. Yeah.**
 3 A. -- with that because it wasn't -- it was
 4 not no way equitable in the past.
 5 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 6 A. And this system is not equitable. You
 7 know.
 8 **Q. Did the implementation of the Foundation**
 9 **system, was that beneficial to black students?**
 10 A. From where they were, it is.
 11 **Q. Yeah.**
 12 A. But not to where it should be.
 13 **Q. Okay.**
 14 A. And that's why I stepped in to do what
 15 you see I'm trying to do now.
 16 **Q. And are you hopeful?**
 17 A. I'm hopeful. Because at least I'm
 18 getting some recognition from my colleagues that
 19 yeah, we got to do something else. The money is
 20 not getting to the schools and the kids who need
 21 it the most. So I'm optimistic that we're going
 22 to get that worked out.
 23 **Q. So with that in mind, what grade would**

Page 144

1 **you give the legislature for education?**
 2 A. When? You talking about this session
 3 right here?
 4 **Q. I'm talking about right now as we sit**
 5 **here and you look back over what the legislature's**
 6 **done.**
 7 A. In certain areas, they'll get good
 8 grades. Certain areas they wouldn't. So I guess
 9 I'd have to say it that way.
 10 **Q. Yeah.**
 11 A. You know the creation of the math program
 12 that we did --
 13 **Q. Uh-huh. Uh-huh.**
 14 A. -- they get a very good grade. I'd say
 15 a B.
 16 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 17 A. They get a good grade on that.
 18 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 19 A. But the way that we initially handled
 20 the -- what do they call it? The reading. The
 21 reading --
 22 **Q. The reading program?**
 23 A. The -- what do they call it? Literacy.



Page 145

Page 147

1 **Q. Literacy, yeah.**

2 A. The way we handled that, at least in the
3 past, I think we get a D.

4 **Q. Has that been corrected?**

5 A. I mean -- well, it's yes and no.
6 Because, you know, see, we had COVID.

7 **Q. Yeah.**

8 A. And they still wanted to test these kids
9 whether they're going to flunk them or not.

10 **Q. Yeah.**

11 A. We had COVID.

12 **Q. Yeah.**

13 A. Hadn't no one been to school a year and a
14 half or two years, and you're getting ready to
15 test whether they're going to stay in the third
16 grade or not.

17 So I passed the bill the first time --
18 the legislature passed -- but it was not signed
19 into law. And then when we got to the last year,
20 I passed it again, and it was signed into law but
21 only for one year. So now this year coming up is
22 where the testing is going to take place.

23 So now we got the same situation with

1 will help us to move in that direction. I'm
2 hoping so.

3 **Q. What grade would you give the legislature
4 for opportunities for employment?**

5 A. Oh, I think we -- we're moving in --
6 we're probably a B.

7 **Q. Okay.**

8 A. You know, we got that Work Alabama.

9 **Q. Yeah.**

10 A. Yeah, I think that that's a very good
11 program. I think it's very good.

12 **Q. Would you say that the Democratic party
13 is more responsive to issues that are important to
14 black Alabamians than the Republican party?**

15 A. Are they more responsive to what kind of
16 issues did you say?

17 **Q. Issues of importance to black Alabamians.**

18 A. I think they have a better understanding,
19 I will say that. So in that, I think that that
20 would be more of a priority for them. Let me put
21 it to you that way. It would be more of a
22 priority.

23 **Q. Are there issues of common ground between**

Page 146

Page 148

1 kindergarten. They coming to kindergarten and not
2 passing those steps, then they're going to put
3 them in kindergarten if they're 6 years old.

4 **Q. Uh-huh.**

5 A. See? So you see what I'm getting at now.
6 It's just that no, if you put grades on -- that
7 doesn't speak well for what we've been doing if we
8 got kids who are in the third grade but the
9 process of handling it needs some modification to
10 take in consideration COVID and teacher shortages.

11 **Q. Right.**

12 A. You've got substitute teachers who are
13 permanent substitutes who are there for the whole
14 year. And so, you know, all this should be taken
15 into consideration and it's not. That's the part.
16 It's not just throwing money.

17 **Q. Yeah.**

18 A. You know. You --

19 **Q. Are you -- did I cut you off?**

20 A. No. Go ahead.

21 **Q. Are you hopeful for positive change in
22 the legislature coming up?**

23 A. I'm hoping so. I'm hoping this committee

1 **Republicans and Democrats in Alabama?**

2 A. Yeah. I won't say necessarily parties.

3 **Q. Yeah.**

4 A. But I would say individual Republicans.

5 But yes, I would say that's the case. I mean, you
6 know, it depends on what the issues are.

7 **Q. What would be the issues?**

8 A. Business.

9 **Q. Business?**

10 A. Yes. I think pretty much, you know,
11 you --

12 **Q. Uh-huh.**

13 A. You have -- closer on one accord as it
14 relates to business issues. And probably crime to
15 a certain degree, those in particular --

16 **Q. Yeah.**

17 A. -- you probably would, because nobody
18 wants crime.

19 **Q. What about education moving forward?**

20 A. I'm concerned that it's not as much
21 concern from the majority party about public
22 education. You know, you got -- you know, anytime
23 you take -- for instance, you've got -- they want



Page 149

Page 151

1 to -- you've got -- you have a home school
 2 process.
 3 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 4 A. -- where they want -- watch this one.
 5 They don't want no part of public education.
 6 Don't like it. They criticize it. But, by the
 7 way, we want the ability in the statute to be able
 8 to enroll in the art program at the same public
 9 school --
 10 **Q. Right.**
 11 A. -- that we can't stand and won't go.
 12 **Q. Yeah. Okay.**
 13 A. And now you -- and I'm going to just say
 14 it from an administrative side. I ain't going to
 15 even say it from the other side. Administrative,
 16 how is the school who's going to be liable for
 17 this student that only comes one time who is not
 18 enrolled in the school but they're going to be
 19 responsible for the student? You can't be if
 20 they're not under the -- governed by enrolling in
 21 the school itself. Because getting in the program
 22 is not enrolling in the school. They just want to
 23 enroll into the class. So that's -- that's what I

1 know, as far as the issues. He didn't --
 2 **Q. Right.**
 3 A. He didn't try to alienate anybody off or
 4 anything. And that's what I admire about him.
 5 **Q. How has that changed for the current**
 6 **leadership?**
 7 A. Well, I haven't heard what their
 8 positions are, their approach, because I haven't
 9 been to any of their meetings. And so I just -- I
 10 don't know what, you know, the new leadership is
 11 trying to do in that regard.
 12 **Q. Under the new leadership post-John**
 13 **England, what's your perception of the strength of**
 14 **the Alabama Democratic Party?**
 15 A. Well, it's not so much the strength of
 16 the party. I just think that it is the general
 17 our state's makeup is a little different. I think
 18 some of the issues. And I think that has a lot to
 19 do with it.
 20 I think the sensitivity is low to people
 21 who need the most. That's the best way I can say
 22 it. I just think the sensitivity. Having been
 23 there this many years --

Page 150

Page 152

1 mean.
 2 **Q. I'm trying to speed this up.**
 3 A. Okay.
 4 **Q. Who are the current leaders of the**
 5 **Alabama Democratic Party?**
 6 A. I can't recall that lady's -- I think the
 7 lady -- I can't recall the lady's name.
 8 **Q. Tabitha Isner?**
 9 A. That may be it.
 10 **Q. Do you know any other leaders of the**
 11 **party right now?**
 12 A. No. They changed over. I remember
 13 John -- Representative England was in charge of
 14 it.
 15 **Q. Right.**
 16 A. But I don't know -- because I'm not on
 17 the executive committee. So I don't know.
 18 **Q. How would you describe the party when it**
 19 **was under Representative England as opposed to the**
 20 **party as it is now?**
 21 A. Well, I don't know about it now. I would
 22 say that he tried to have a large enough umbrella
 23 that everybody could get under that umbrella, you

1 **Q. The party sensitivity?**
 2 A. Well, I just think that the majority, who
 3 ultimately make those decisions, lack some of the
 4 necessary sensitivity to things that's happening
 5 to people out there. Just basic things. People,
 6 you know, they're trying to make ends meet.
 7 They're trying to -- you know, we talk about
 8 providing funds for education --
 9 **Q. Yeah.**
 10 A. -- yet we want to turn around and put 100
 11 to 400 million into the Choice Act and yet all I
 12 asked for was 206 million to help every -- every
 13 failing school.
 14 **Q. Yeah.**
 15 A. But we can vote to put the 100 with a
 16 maximum possible 400 million for people who want
 17 to just take the money, say I don't want to go to
 18 this school. I want to go over here, and then
 19 ignore the people who don't have a choice, who
 20 have a need --
 21 **Q. Uh-huh.**
 22 A. -- and the school is suffering because it
 23 doesn't have the resources. That's the concern.



Senator Rodger Smitherman

153..156

Page 153

1 **Q. What's the function of a political party?**
 2 **To run candidates?**
 3 A. Well, I won't just say only to -- only to
 4 run candidates. I would think the function of a
 5 political party is to put support behind certain
 6 issues that will affect people.
 7 **Q. And -- I'm sorry.**
 8 A. You know, and I just -- you know, I see
 9 that more than anything, that that's what it
 10 really is.
 11 **Q. And is one of the primary ways a**
 12 **political party does that by running candidates**
 13 **who support those issues?**
 14 A. Yeah, I think they would support
 15 candidates --
 16 **Q. Yeah.**
 17 A. -- who run -- who support those issues.
 18 Whether they were running them or not.
 19 **Q. Yes.**
 20 A. You know, I think if the candidate
 21 supports that issue, then I think that they -- you
 22 know, they would push forward.
 23 **Q. Has in recent history the Democratic**

Page 154

1 **party done a good job of fielding strong**
 2 **candidates for statewide election?**
 3 A. Well, in some situations, yes. And then
 4 we have some that, you know, not necessarily. You
 5 know, it varies.
 6 **Q. Yeah.**
 7 A. I think both parties have done that
 8 though, you know, in terms of strong candidates
 9 or --
 10 **Q. Are you -- did I interrupt you? I'm**
 11 **sorry.**
 12 A. No, no. I'm through.
 13 **Q. Are you aware or do you recall that in**
 14 **2022, there were elections for state officials**
 15 **where the Libertarian party had candidates on the**
 16 **ballot to challenge Republicans but the Democrats**
 17 **didn't?**
 18 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.
 19 A. I -- I don't -- I don't recall a memory,
 20 but I wouldn't question -- you know, I wouldn't
 21 take issue with you what you just said.
 22 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Do you know who Yolanda**
 23 **Flowers is?**

Page 155

1 A. Yes.
 2 **Q. Who is she?**
 3 A. Lady that ran for governor.
 4 **Q. Did she have any qualification for that**
 5 **position in your opinion?**
 6 A. Yeah. I think she was qualified.
 7 **Q. Okay.**
 8 A. I mean, you know, it's unfortunate we
 9 don't have orientation or a pre-class to be a
 10 politician. So it's not something she should have
 11 gone and gotten versus that. I think her just
 12 life experiences probably would qualify her.
 13 **Q. Do you know who Ruth Page Nelson is?**
 14 A. No.
 15 **Q. Do you know who Will Boyd is?**
 16 A. Yeah.
 17 **Q. Who is he?**
 18 A. I think he ran for what? Lieutenant
 19 governor?
 20 **Q. Senate.**
 21 A. Senate.
 22 **Q. In '22?**
 23 A. Senate 2022.

Page 156

1 **Q. Did you know him before he ran?**
 2 A. I knew him but not personally.
 3 **Q. Has he a previous background in politics?**
 4 A. He might have run for something else.
 5 I'm not sure. I don't know.
 6 **Q. Do you know how well funded his campaign**
 7 **was?**
 8 A. No, I don't.
 9 **Q. Do you know who Wendell Major is?**
 10 A. I do.
 11 **Q. Who is he?**
 12 A. He's the -- I think I got it right. He's
 13 the Sheriff of Tarrant now. Tarrant City Sheriff.
 14 **Q. Ran for attorney general in '22?**
 15 A. Yes.
 16 **Q. Do you know who Pamela Laffitte is?**
 17 A. I think I do. I've heard that name. I
 18 think I know. I'm not sure. I can't visualize
 19 right now, but I think I do.
 20 **Q. Do you know if white voters in Alabama**
 21 **usually prefer Republican candidates?**
 22 A. I -- prefer in certain -- certain areas
 23 of the state maybe. You know, I wouldn't -- I

ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Senator Rodger Smitherman

157..160

Page 157

1 wouldn't use that as a blanket statement, for
2 instance, and say up here. Because as I said --

3 **Q. Jefferson County?**

4 A. Uh-uh. Because, once again, the
5 functionality study going to show you.

6 **Q. Yeah.**

7 A. Yeah, it's just going to show you. You
8 know, regardless of what opinion, I mean, the
9 study's going to speak for itself.

10 **Q. Do you think that white voters support**
11 **the Republican party -- in general. We're**
12 **speaking in terms of generalities here, of**
13 **course -- because of that party's view on issues**
14 **with which they agree?**

15 A. I think a big part of it -- I can't put
16 the numbers and things, but I think a big part of
17 it is race.

18 **Q. Explain to me.**

19 A. Is race. Well, I just -- I just think
20 the -- let me try to give you an example.

21 In part, you know, you have people
22 campaigning. And you have people campaigning who
23 their campaign is based on racial rhetoric.

Page 158

1 **Q. Can you --**

2 A. And you have -- you have that having an
3 impact on how the voters you just asked me about,
4 some of them, view a candidate that they may not
5 really even know much about.

6 **Q. Can you give me some examples, Senator**
7 **Smitherman?**

8 A. Not right off, I can't.

9 **Q. Okay. Can black congressional candidates**
10 **win under the Singleton Plan, the Smitherman Plan,**
11 **or the Court-Ordered Plan without the support of**
12 **white voters?**

13 A. Uh-uh. You're going to have to --
14 maybe -- maybe in 7. You know, that close 7,
15 around 50, 56 percent.

16 **Q. Yeah.**

17 A. Maybe there. But, no, you're going to
18 have to have white voters in these opportunity
19 districts. And that's why you -- once again. I
20 know I'm going back to the same statement, but
21 that's why you have to look at the functionality
22 report.

23 **Q. Right.**

Page 159

1 A. To see whether or not. You know the
2 labels that we give them, you've got to have
3 independent voters. You know.

4 **Q. What has the Democratic Party done or is**
5 **doing now to attract white voters, if anything?**

6 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

7 Go ahead.

8 A. I don't know per se what the party is
9 doing.

10 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Uh-huh.**

11 A. I don't know specifically. I couldn't
12 tell you if they've got this program or if there's
13 an outreach program or -- as a party, I don't
14 know, you know, what programs they may have
15 instituted to do that.

16 **Q. What does it mean to you to have a voice**
17 **in the political process?**

18 A. That -- that I can be heard as it relates
19 to those issues in the process and that what I --
20 say that if I -- I make a solid case for, it will
21 have an impact on as we move forward and what we
22 do to address to help people no matter what the
23 winner is and not just have an opportunity to sit

Page 160

1 up there and say what I think ought to be done and
2 show it. And sort of not a token opportunity but
3 a very serious opportunity. And that's what we go
4 back to what we're doing here. I keep talking
5 about the functionality study.

6 **Q. Right.**

7 A. You know, if you don't have an
8 opportunity district, first of all, you're not --
9 you know, that's just -- it's nice to stand up and
10 say all them good things, whatever, but you're not
11 going to have a reasonable opportunity to affect
12 them. But if the district is of such that, as we
13 say, is an opportunity district, you're going to
14 have a shot at it. You're going to have an
15 opportunity to do that. And I think that that's
16 what's critical.

17 **Q. If there's an election and the issues**
18 **that are important to, let's just say, the black**
19 **community are discussed in the election but,**
20 **nevertheless, the black candidate of choice loses,**
21 **under those circumstances, would you feel like**
22 **you've had a voice in the election?**

23 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Page 161

1 A. Say that again for me again, please.
 2 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Yeah. If your**
 3 **candidate loses but the issues that are important**
 4 **to you have been discussed in the election, would**
 5 **you say that, notwithstanding the loss, you've had**
 6 **a voice in the objection?**

7 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

8 A. Uh-uh. Uh-uh. A voice is not being able
 9 to just only say. Remember I said that that -- I
 10 guess the best words I can use is unless I can
 11 have an opportunity to really have an --
 12 opportunity -- really have a impact, that's just
 13 tokenism.

14 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Okay.**

15 A. Yeah. I mean, that's -- that's not --
 16 it's -- you know, it's -- nobody, you know -- it's
 17 not -- this is not -- and I'm not saying what
 18 we're doing here, but I'm just talking about --

19 **Q. Right.**

20 A. -- what we're trying to do with the
 21 opportunity district. This is not to show. This
 22 is giving an opportunity for people to really have
 23 an impact. And I think that that's -- that's it

Page 162

1 in part. You know, whether or not the elements
 2 are there that you're going to have a reasonable
 3 enough opportunity to impact it. You may not get
 4 everything you want. You know, it may not be
 5 specifically the way you sitting up there
 6 saying --

7 **Q. Yeah.**

8 A. -- but when you walk out of there, it's
 9 for the better. If you bringing things to the
 10 table for the better, then it changes. You know,
 11 it was just like what I said about the 206 --

12 **Q. I got you.**

13 A. I mean, yeah, it's some people who were
 14 concerned for other reasons about just turning
 15 a-loose the million dollars apiece to everybody.
 16 But the fact that they allowed it to have enough
 17 impact that, okay, we need to have this committee
 18 together and look seriously at this and see what
 19 we can do to address that.

20 That's what you want. You know, you
 21 want an environment where you can have a shot, you
 22 have a chance --

23 **Q. Uh-huh.**

Page 163

1 A. -- a fair, reasonable opportunity to do
 2 that.

3 **Q. Do you believe that the current districts**
 4 **in which the candidate preferred by African**
 5 **Americans -- in Congressional District 7 and**
 6 **District 2 -- may or may not be elected because**
 7 **they're opportunity districts, do you believe that**
 8 **those districts give black Alabamians a voice in**
 9 **the political process?**

10 A. Yes, I do.

11 **Q. Okay.**

12 A. I do. I do.

13 **Q. About to wrap up.**

14 A. Okay.

15 **Q. Let me ask you a few more questions.**

16 **You've talked about you were there when**
 17 **desegregation happened. And I'll just say I was**
 18 **there too although -- it happened in Cloverdale as**
 19 **well. But are things better today -- I'm not**
 20 **saying are things perfect today, but are things**
 21 **better today with regard to race relations than**
 22 **when you grew up?**

23 A. Well, take -- take politics out, I would

Page 164

1 say it's -- it's -- it's probably -- yeah, I would
 2 say the communication and the interaction of
 3 people is a lot better now. That's why I -- I
 4 keep going back to it, but the functionality
 5 study. I mean, it shows that there are people
 6 that do that.

7 **Q. Right.**

8 A. And then, you know, I've been able to
 9 make a comparison and an analysis, you know, from
 10 the 1970s until now, you know, because -- when I
 11 was in college.

12 **Q. Uh-huh.**

13 A. You know, I'll just say it to you like
 14 this. I was in an all-white fraternity.

15 **Q. Oh. Okay.**

16 A. All my fraternity brothers look like you.

17 **Q. Yeah. They were bald?**

18 A. Okay? And all my little sisters look
 19 like her. See? So when I say that, I had a
 20 chance to live across --

21 **Q. Right.**

22 A. -- to understand that. And then, of
 23 course, my first taste of politics, I ran campus



Page 165

1 wide for student senate.

2 **Q. Uh-huh.**

3 A. Which it was 40 -- it probably was more
4 than that. I'd say it was 40 black students out
5 of the whole student population. And I ran campus
6 wide against two candidates that looked like you,
7 and I won. So it helps.

8 **Q. Yeah.**

9 A. So it's -- when you hear me talk about
10 the interactions and when you hear me talk about
11 opportunity districts, I know they're in the right
12 places that if an opportunity district is there,
13 that people can. Because you're looking at
14 somebody, 40 to 2,500 --

15 **Q. Uh-huh.**

16 A. -- and I won?

17 **Q. Yeah.**

18 A. So if opportunity -- I got the
19 opportunity, and I won. That's why I said it's
20 important to have those opportunity districts.

21 **Q. Have things improved in Alabama racially**
22 **with regard to education?**

23 MR. BLACKSHER: Objection to form.

Page 166

1 **Q. (BY MR. WALKER:) Since you were a child?**

2 A. How far back you want to go? Before
3 integration or afterwards?

4 **Q. Your perception from when you were a**
5 **child to now.**

6 A. Well, you know, I was, in elementary and
7 middle school and high school up through tenth
8 grade, I was in the world that was supposed to be
9 separate but equal.

10 **Q. Yeah.**

11 A. You know. And it wasn't nothing equal
12 about getting these tore-up books that --

13 **Q. Right.**

14 A. -- somebody's had -- you know how they
15 just write in there who had it this year and that
16 year, and it's about the third time and the back
17 about to come off?

18 **Q. Uh-huh.**

19 A. You know, versus people who getting
20 brand-new books and we getting the ones that they
21 don't want. So that's -- that's what was
22 happening some during that period.

23 But after we integrated then, of course,

Page 167

1 the opportunity to get those kind of things was a
2 lot better. But still, you had the problems. You
3 had the resistance. You had the resistance when
4 we walked into PE to change clothes. You'd be
5 surprised the kind of resistance that we faced,
6 you know.

7 **Q. Uh-huh.**

8 A. But as times began to change and, of
9 course, people began to get a better acceptance of
10 each other. And I think we've come a long ways in
11 that regard. But in terms of political
12 opportunities, we have not advanced to nowhere
13 where we need to be, you know --

14 **Q. When you say political opportunities,**
15 **what do you mean?**

16 A. Well, we're in a state with what? How
17 many -- 26, 27, 28 percent African American?

18 **Q. 26. 26. 26 plus change.**

19 A. Change. Plus change. You know. And yet
20 we only have one person -- opportunity to pick one
21 person, point-blank. And that's -- that's not
22 good. You know. That's not good.

23 **Q. What about have things improved in the**

Page 168

1 **state over the course of your lifetime in terms of**
2 **jobs? Discrimination and jobs?**

3 A. Well, there was a period that it did.
4 There was a period.

5 **Q. That it did improve?**

6 A. Yes, it did improve. But we've began to
7 slide backwards now. Beginning to slide
8 backwards.

9 **Q. Explain to me what you mean about that,**
10 **please.**

11 A. Well, you know, you -- you know, there's
12 trying to be a de-emphasis on diversity and
13 equity --

14 **Q. Uh-huh.**

15 A. -- like they --

16 **Q. Oh, you're talking about what's going on**
17 **now?**

18 A. Yeah. We -- we're going backwards now.
19 I have a -- I know you didn't ask me this and
20 that's probably -- wish you hadn't, but I'm going
21 to share it with you.

22 If you walk in my office right now,
23 you'll see a picture. If you ever come, I'm going



Page 169

1 to show you the picture. It's a picture on the
2 wall.

3 **Q. Uh-huh.**

4 A. And it was the last elected legislators,
5 Congress and the legislature in Alabama before
6 Reconstruction.

7 **Q. Oh, yeah.**

8 A. It's up there for a reason.

9 **Q. Right. And I know what the reason was.**

10 A. You probably heard me say that on the
11 floor. And it's a simple reason and it concerns
12 me because I can see a visual movement that these
13 bills and things we're passing is an effort,
14 directly or indirectly or by a certain group or
15 whatever, but it's an effort to turn us back and
16 take us back to -- and take away the things that
17 we have had the opportunity -- through
18 collaborative effort by everybody -- to move
19 forward.

20 To give a -- last example on that is
21 that the realtors, they're in court now
22 challenging the -- their commission where it says
23 that they're going to put two African Americans on

Page 170

1 there. They're trying to get the court to
2 overturn that so they don't have to put none on
3 there. That's what I mean when I say that;
4 that --

5 **Q. Okay.**

6 A. Yeah. Even though the legislature itself
7 has -- we have some general language that's pretty
8 acceptable that we should have diversity that we
9 think will meet the muster -- over the years we've
10 used the same language that --

11 **Q. Every time y'all create a commission,**
12 **yeah.**

13 A. Yeah. Yeah, so instead of putting
14 "quota," but that's what I mean. That's a
15 concerted effort to turn the clocks back. And
16 that's why we've got -- if we're depending on
17 where we are now -- I don't mean these districts.
18 But them old ones --

19 **Q. Uh-huh.**

20 A. -- we're not going to ever get
21 representation other than just that one that's
22 packed.

23 **Q. Have things improved in the area of**

Page 171

1 **health care over the course of your life for black**
2 **people in Alabama?**

3 A. Yes, because, of course, you know, when
4 I -- when you say my life, remember I'm -- I'm Jim
5 Crow era.

6 **Q. Yeah.**

7 A. I can tell you when I used to have to go
8 to the doctor's office and we had one little room
9 half as big as this here and all the black people
10 packed up in that room and then you had a big,
11 beautiful place like this right here where the,
12 you know --

13 **Q. Right.**

14 A. -- majority population just walk in and
15 get waited.

16 Now, I know you didn't ask me this, but
17 I'm going to tell you. I -- I got waited on
18 because I went in the big room. They didn't want
19 me in there, so they said, "Come on. Let's take
20 you on to the doctor, get him out of here now."
21 So, yes, I'm not going to stand back and not get
22 waited on.

23 **Q. Do you have any information we haven't**

Page 172

1 **already discussed today about the history of**
2 **official voting-related discrimination in the**
3 **State of Alabama?**

4 A. No.

5 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

6 MR. WALKER: You said object to form?

7 A. I don't have any information.

8 MR. BLACKSHER: I didn't understand the
9 question; I'm sorry.

10 MR. WALKER: Okay. It's just a wrap-up
11 question.

12 **Q. Did -- I asked the senator if he had any**
13 **information about the history of official**
14 **voting-related discrimination in the State of**
15 **Alabama that we haven't discussed?**

16 A. Not to my knowledge. I'm -- no. I'm
17 aware there are some other issues out there, but I
18 can't recall specifically what those issues would
19 be or when they happened or anything like that.

20 **Q. Do you have any information that we**
21 **haven't discussed today that concerns voting**
22 **practices in Alabama or that Alabama has used that**
23 **you believe make it easier to discriminate against**



Page 173

1 black voters?

2 A. Well, I think we -- since I've been in
3 the legislature -- I mean, I'm going back to when
4 I first got there. It was in '95, '96, in there,
5 that we've been -- the body has been passing laws
6 that, in my opinion, has been trying to discourage
7 people from voting or making it more difficult for
8 them to vote; from the voter IDs to to now, you
9 can't help anybody whatsoever, to filling out --
10 it's just that where -- you know. I think that
11 the legislature has passed bills that have began
12 to -- have made it very difficult or more
13 difficult for people to register as well as to
14 vote. Especially minorities. I do. And I say
15 that because that's just my opinion.

16 Q. Sure.

17 A. I feel that they are -- let me use the
18 words -- and I can wrap you up with me. Let me
19 use the words that I sincerely, you know, believe.

20 Q. Uh-huh.

21 A. And I've said it numerous times on the
22 Senate floor. I don't get the benefit of the
23 doubt. Point-blank. You do. Not you personally.

Page 174

1 Q. Yeah.

2 A. But you walk in with the assumption of
3 the benefit of the doubt --

4 Q. You mean because I'm white?**5 A. Yeah.****6 Q. Okay.****7 A. I don't get the benefit of the doubt.****8 Q. Because you're black?****9 A. Yeah.****10 Q. Okay.**

11 A. And I've been in situations where I've
12 gone in dressed in my ball stuff and folks don't
13 know I'm the senator.

14 Q. Yeah.

15 A. And I've gone in big stores and having
16 worked in retail. And I had my son with me, and I
17 said, "I'm going to show you." I showed him.
18 He's a grown man now. Fully grown. But I said,
19 "I'm going to show you what it is being a black
20 man in this world."

21 Q. Uh-huh.

22 A. We walked in. I got a jogging suit on,
23 my hat. I think I got these, the Ray-Bans, on.

Page 175

1 Q. Yeah.

2 A. I walk in there. Time I walked through
3 the door -- and when you hear this, you're going
4 to know. It may not be about you, but that's what
5 they're doing. When you walk in a store, you
6 hear, a "ding, ding, ding, ding, ding" -- you ever
7 heard that little "ding, ding, ding, ding, ding"?
8 That's security. They on you.

9 Q. Uh-huh.

10 A. And I told him, I said, "Now, that means
11 they on us. Two black men. We're going to go
12 over into this little area." Like we went to get
13 something.

14 Q. Yeah.

15 A. And I said -- and I told him, I said,
16 "Look over my left shoulder. Two rows down. What
17 you see?" He said, "Security." I said, "They
18 watching us."

19 Okay. And you say what's the
20 significance of that? I paid for what we got and
21 walked out of there. Went to church, put on a
22 suit, walked through -- went back. I said, "Now,
23 come on. I'm going to show you the difference."

Page 176

1 Walked in there. No "ding, ding."

2 People looked up there, said, "Hey, Senator, how
3 you doing?" Now ain't no "ding, ding," nobody
4 watching me or nothing. That's what I meant.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. If I ain't the senator -- if they don't
7 know I'm the senator, this same senator, I ain't
8 nothing but just a black man and I'm going to get
9 treated the way that it is.

10 Remember, I been profiled over five
11 times. Montgomery Police profiled me going to the
12 State House. Yeah. Right downtown on the main
13 street with the sticker on the back of my car.
14 Okay?

15 So I just -- and, you know, till he
16 realized who I was.

17 Q. Yeah.

18 A. You know, so. And he ain't the only one.
19 I've done had Birmingham Police do the same thing.
20 And it ain't about black and white. It's the
21 profile. You're going to get profiled if you
22 black. You know. And so that's the same benefit
23 of the doubt you don't get.



Page 177

1 And that's why we've got to have these
2 opportunity districts because, you know, you ain't
3 going to get -- if you don't have a -- if you're
4 not in a situation like that, you ain't fixing to
5 get the benefit of the doubt. Uh-uh.

6 **Q. Okay. Thank you.**

7 **Is there anything sitting here today**
8 **that you expect to testify about at trial that we**
9 **haven't discussed?**

10 A. No.

11 MR. WALKER: Senator Smitherman, that's
12 my last question. Now, Mr. Blacksher --

13 MR. BLACKSHER: Could we have a
14 five-minute recess?

15 MR. WALKER: Let's take a five-minute
16 break, yeah.

17 (Recess.)

18 MR. BLACKSHER: I just really have one
19 question, Senator Smitherman.

20 MS. MESSICK: Jim?

21 MR. BLACKSHER: Yes?

22 MS. MESSICK: Jim, I'm sorry.

23 MR. BLACKSHER: Oh, you had some

Page 178

1 questions? I'm sorry.

2 MS. MESSICK: Yeah, I just want to say I
3 do have some questions before you get started.
4 I'm happy to go before or after you, whatever your
5 preference is.

6 MR. BLACKSHER: No, you go ahead. That
7 would be fine. Thank you. I'm sorry.

8 THE WITNESS: And she's the attorney for?

9 MR. WALKER: Secretary of State Allen.

10 MR. BLACKSHER: She's the attorney for
11 Secretary of State Allen.

12 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay. Okay.

13 EXAMINATION

14 BY MS. MESSICK:

15 **Q. Good afternoon, Senator.**

16 A. Good afternoon.

17 **Q. My name is Misty Messick. And as I just**
18 **told you, I am the lawyer for Secretary of State**
19 **Wes Allen, who's actually additionally sued in**
20 **this matter.**

21 A. Okay.

22 **Q. And I just have a few questions for you.**
23 **I wanted to start, late in your**

Page 179

1 **testimony, you mentioned that you have been**
2 **racially profiled five times. I was really sorry**
3 **to hear that, and I wanted to understand more**
4 **about that.**

5 **When is the last time -- the most recent**
6 **time that that happened?**

7 A. I don't know the exact date. I don't
8 know the exact date. I don't recall it. I
9 didn't, you know, categorize it, catalog it or
10 anything, but I don't know exactly. It's been
11 several years ago.

12 **Q. Was it more than ten years ago?**

13 A. I just don't know. I -- you know,
14 remember I'm under oath. So I don't know for
15 certain.

16 **Q. Okay. And I believe you said you were**
17 **pulled over once by the Montgomery Police and once**
18 **by the Birmingham Police?**

19 A. I've been pulled over twice by
20 Birmingham.

21 **Q. Do you remember when you -- either one of**
22 **those were?**

23 A. No. I don't. But one of them, my wife

Page 180

1 was in the car with me. Who happens to be a
2 judge.

3 **Q. She's a state court judge up in Jefferson**
4 **County?**

5 A. Yes. Yes.

6 **Q. Have you ever been pulled over by a state**
7 **trooper in Alabama?**

8 A. Not profiled, no.

9 **Q. Do you remember where the other instances**
10 **where you believe you were profiled happened? You**
11 **said there were a total of five and two were in**
12 **Birmingham and one in Montgomery?**

13 A. And one was in Homewood. And another was
14 on the interstate in another state. Then I left
15 one out, which this is probably about 30 or 40
16 years ago. I -- same thing happened to me in
17 Slidell, Louisiana, as well.

18 **Q. When the legislature was working on**
19 **drawing a new map in 2023 after it was decided**
20 **that the 2021 Map could not be used for these**
21 **current elections, do you remember any talk of**
22 **Kevin McCarthy being on the phone with members of**
23 **the legislature?**



Page 181

1 A. I don't recall.
 2 **Q. Do you know who Kevin McCarthy was at the**
 3 **time that that map was being drawn?**

4 A. I've heard of the name, but I just don't
 5 recall specifically. Remember I'm under oath. So
 6 I don't -- if I can't recall specifically, you
 7 know, I'm not going to...

8 **Q. Okay. He was the Speaker of the United**
 9 **States House of Representatives.**

10 A. Oh, yeah. Oh, yeah. Now I know who
 11 you're talking about, yeah.

12 **Q. Do you remember hearing that he was on**
 13 **the phone with people in the Alabama legislature**
 14 **while that map was being drawn in 2023?**

15 A. Well, I didn't hear necessarily he was on
 16 the phone. But since you're saying what I heard,
 17 I can't substantiate who I heard it from exactly
 18 if you ask me the name right now, but I did -- but
 19 it was mentioned --

20 MR. BLACKSHER: I'm going to instruct the
 21 witness not to answer that question if it calls
 22 for hearsay.

23 A. Well, it's hearsay. I don't have any

Page 182

1 proof. It is hearsay.

2 **Q. (BY MS. MESSICK:) All right. But we**
 3 **don't make hearsay objections in a deposition**
 4 **normally.**

5 **Do you remember hearing about any other**
 6 **members of the United States Congress in**
 7 **communications with any members of the Alabama**
 8 **legislature when that map was being drawn? So it**
 9 **could be Democrat or Republican side.**

10 A. Well, it's, there again, that I -- I
 11 don't know for a fact. I didn't have any direct
 12 conversation with the person who may have called
 13 or I wasn't standing there when there was a phone
 14 conversation with somebody like that, so I don't
 15 know, you know, from that perspective whether that
 16 certainly actually happened or not. I don't know.

17 **Q. Are you aware of whether the national**
 18 **Democrats are involved in the CD-2 race?**

19 A. No, I don't know because I'm not on the
 20 executive committee or anything like that, so I
 21 don't know for certain. Not for certain I don't.

22 **Q. Do you know whether the national**
 23 **Republicans are involved in the CD-2 race?**

Page 183

1 A. Not for certain I don't know, no.

2 **Q. I believe earlier you suggested that you**
 3 **were concerned that the Mobile area might be**
 4 **gerrymandered in the court-ordered map which I**
 5 **believe is Exhibit 3 that you have in front of**
 6 **you.**

7 A. Exhibit 3? Exhibit 3? This one?

8 MR. WALKER: That one.

9 THE WITNESS: This one right here?

10 MR. WALKER: Yes, sir.

11 **Q. (BY MS. MESSICK:) Yeah. Did you say**
 12 **that you had concerns that Mobile was**
 13 **gerrymandered in that map?**

14 A. What I think I said was, was that this
 15 drawing here goes in to get part of that and some
 16 of the appearances of gerrymandering, where all
 17 the areas where there are parts of the county are
 18 taken out. I said that across the blanket. I
 19 said Jefferson County. I talked about Lauderdale.
 20 I talked about Elmore -- I think it's Elmore --
 21 and Tuscaloosa. So, you know, my reference was
 22 any county where that you had gone in that wasn't
 23 whole because I think we were discussing the whole

Page 184

1 county plan. And that's what the reference was
 2 into, the fact that these counties had been split
 3 and not kept whole.

4 **Q. And what voters are you saying that that**
 5 **map went in to get in Mobile?**

6 A. Well, I mean, I don't have it here in
 7 front of me to say with certainty who they got.
 8 But I will say I can only go back to Jefferson
 9 County. I know for certain they went in to get
 10 black voters to satisfy District 7. Because I
 11 live in Jefferson County and I live in that part
 12 of the county and I represent.

13 **Q. Mr. Walker asked you about racial appeals**
 14 **in campaigns. And I believe you told him that you**
 15 **believe that code words were being -- were still**
 16 **used but you couldn't really remember the last**
 17 **time you had seen a racial appeal in a campaign.**
 18 **And then sometime later, you were talking about**
 19 **racial appeals again like it was something that's**
 20 **more common. And so I wondered if, during the**
 21 **course of your deposition while you've been**
 22 **sitting here today, you thought of any examples of**
 23 **when you've seen racial appeals used in elections**



Page 185

1 in Alabama?

2 A. And I can't name specific dates and
3 times. At this time I can't, you know. But I --
4 you know, I know that I've seen them. Remember --
5 remember --

6 Q. Okay. And I --

7 A. Remember, I'm the product of segregation
8 and integration. I know what I see. It's just
9 that I don't have any reason to record it and pin
10 it and say this is the date and time this has
11 happened and keep this as I walk through my life.
12 No, I don't do that. I try to forget them,
13 really, because, you know, it's not -- those are
14 not nice things and I just try not to embrace
15 them.

16 Q. I understand that. I'm not asking you
17 for a specific date or time. I'm asking a
18 specific election, a time frame. It's something
19 much broader than that.

20 A. I understand. I'm not -- I can't recall
21 tracking it in somebody's election to that extent,
22 you know. So I -- other than my own, you know.
23 So from that perspective.

Page 186

1 Q. Do you think that Kamala Harris will get
2 a different reception in Alabama than Joe Biden
3 would have for the 2024 presidential race?

4 A. Yeah, I think -- I don't know about than
5 Joe Biden would get. I couldn't make that
6 comparison between him and Biden. But I think
7 that she will get a positive -- you know,
8 whether -- I don't know she's going to get a
9 majority, but I think she'll do pretty well in
10 Alabama considering.

11 Q. If I understood you right, I believe you
12 said that you think that race is part of the
13 reason why some white voters in Alabama prefer
14 Republican candidates. And I wondered what makes
15 you say that?

16 At sometimes I've heard other people
17 blame it on history of discrimination in the
18 state. But as you've sat here today, you've
19 talked a lot about how an opportunity district is
20 sufficient in Jefferson County because there are a
21 lot of white Democrats there. And, of course,
22 Birmingham has a tremendous amount of civil rights
23 history. And so I'm wondering why the vote -- the

Page 187

1 white voters in Jefferson County would be
2 different from the white voters in the rest of the
3 state?

4 MR. BLACKSHER: Okay, I'm going to object
5 to the form of that question as being both complex
6 and with a series of faulty predicates. But you
7 may answer if you can, Senator.

8 A. Well, first, I think let's start out with
9 the fact that -- and I'm not saying you say I
10 said, but the inference is that -- I didn't say we
11 had a large number of white Democrats. I actually
12 said, if you look back on that, that we have a
13 large number of independent voters. I didn't call
14 them white Democrats. I called them independent
15 voters, who -- for instance, I -- I can just
16 remember one -- several, several years ago, but
17 one election that I had, I'm over in Homewood, and
18 on one side of the people's yard, they clearly had
19 a -- I won't, you know, call their name out, but a
20 person that was running, I think for U.S. Senate,
21 who was a Republican on this side of their yard,
22 and they had a Smitherman sign on the other side
23 of their yard.

Page 188

1 That's what I mean. We have those kind
2 of voters here. They are independent enough to
3 look at each race and each candidate in those
4 races and make those decisions and give them
5 consideration without race being a controlling
6 factor.

7 That's why you have to look at those
8 functionality studies to see what communities
9 would provide that. And that's what those studies
10 would show you. They show you clearly through
11 that series of races for ten years whether or not
12 they crossed over and this race they voted for an
13 African American and this race they voted for a
14 Republican and this race they voted -- those are
15 the people that you've got to have in the
16 districts -- in those districts to be able to have
17 a fair chance for everybody to be elected. And
18 the district that is drawn now that provides that,
19 District 2, but the district up here that I'm
20 talking about even provides it better.

21 Q. Do you have a sense of whether there are
22 more white independent voters in Jefferson County
23 than in other parts of the state?



Page 189

1 A. Yeah. I think it is. No doubt in my
2 mind I do.

3 **Q. Do you know why that would be?**

4 A. I can't tell you why, you know, but
5 except that, you know, they -- they have more of
6 an open mind, I think. They look at the
7 candidates -- they look at each race -- I think
8 people up here look at each race more individually
9 and who's running, you know, than just lumping
10 everybody in one group.

11 **Q. Are you aware of any changes the Alabama**
12 **legislature has recently made with respect to**
13 **grocery taxes?**

14 A. I think the state -- if I'm correct, and
15 I stand to be corrected, I think the state reduced
16 this amount, you know, trying to get to 4 percent
17 but I think 2 percent and then I think looking at
18 what the economic indicators may, you know, show
19 us or whether or not we can do it -- you know,
20 reduce it 2 more cents. I think that's where we
21 are at in that process right now.

22 **Q. Do you know who pushed in past years for**
23 **changes or reduction in the grocery tax?**

Page 190

1 A. Representative John Knight.

2 **Q. Anybody else?**

3 A. And come after him, but it was John
4 Knight.

5 **Q. And it's historically been an issue that**
6 **Democrats have supported; right?**

7 A. That's correct.

8 **Q. Do you remember any recent large changes**
9 **with respect to gas taxes?**

10 A. Yes. Yes, we voted on whether or not we
11 were going to increase the gas tax.

12 **Q. And what was the result?**

13 A. It passed.

14 **Q. And so did that increase or decrease the**
15 **taxes?**

16 A. It increased them.

17 **Q. Do you know what the new revenue was for?**

18 A. Highway projects and bridges.

19 **Q. Are any of those -- have any projects**
20 **funded by that increased gas tax been announced**
21 **for your district?**

22 A. I want to tell you that one was
23 preannounced as we're trying to pass the tax.

Page 191

1 Well, we had to fix the freeway up here because,
2 you know, a big hole was in the freeway. It was
3 breaking apart. So we had to get it done. But
4 they got it -- they fixed it right in the
5 beginning of that. So, yes, we got the freeway
6 fixed up here and that -- that was in part -- it
7 wasn't right after we passed the tax. It was
8 during the period that we was trying to pass the
9 tax. And -- so --

10 **Q. Are you talking about I-65 or something**
11 **else?**

12 A. Yeah. Right downtown. I-65 where it
13 meets up with I-20/59, you know.

14 **Q. Malfunction Junction?**

15 A. It used to be -- Malfunction Junction,
16 yes.

17 **Q. Okay. Have there been any other projects**
18 **in Jefferson County as a result of that gas tax**
19 **passing?**

20 A. Oh, it has. I can't recall them, but it
21 has.

22 **Q. Did Alabama just pass a new Constitution**
23 **a couple years ago?**

Page 192

1 A. Yes, we passed --

2 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form.

3 **Q. (BY MS. MESSICK:) What, as you sit here**
4 **today, can you tell me about the changes made in**
5 **that Constitution?**

6 A. Not all of it. I just remember we dealt
7 with the racial language. That was one of the
8 things. I think we dealt with some of the racial
9 language that was in there.

10 **Q. And in dealing with it, that language was**
11 **removed?**

12 A. Well, finally. You know, that language
13 has been on the ballot a couple times and it was
14 not removed. To my knowledge. You know, that's
15 the way I see it, I remember it.

16 **Q. Some of the language that was removed was**
17 **already essentially voided under federal law,**
18 **wasn't it?**

19 A. Yes.

20 **Q. What racial language do you remember**
21 **being considered for removal before and kept?**

22 A. I don't remember that language.

23 **Q. Do you remember a fight over removing**



Senator Rodger Smitherman

193..196

Page 193

Page 195

1 racial language that involved education and
2 concerns about what the impact of the proposed
3 change would mean?

4 A. Uh-uh. I don't.

5 Q. I want to return to my questions earlier
6 about the involvement of national political
7 figures in the Alabama legislature's 2023
8 redrawing of the maps. I know that you say that
9 you were not directly part of any conversations,
10 but did you hear about conversations that were
11 going on with national political figures and
12 members of the Alabama legislature?

13 MR. BLACKSHER: Object to form of the
14 question.

15 A. Well, I -- I would think that that would
16 be hearsay. So I -- I -- I don't have any answer
17 other than the fact that I had no direct knowledge
18 whatsoever. None. Wasn't even in the presence of
19 somebody else, you know, talking to somebody out
20 of Washington about that to my knowledge.

21 Q. (BY MS. MESSICK:) Yes, sir. I'm asking
22 you to tell me what you heard.

23 A. And I --

Page 194

Page 196

1 MR. BLACKSHER: I object to the form of
2 the question.

3 A. I'd still say it's hearsay. That would
4 be my answer. Because I can't substantiate
5 anything. So I -- that would be my answer.

6 MS. MESSICK: Thank you for your time
7 this afternoon. I don't have any further
8 questions.

9 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

10 EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. BLACKSHER:

12 Q. Okay. Senator Smitherman, just a couple
13 questions.

14 Ms. Messick just referred to the new
15 Alabama Constitution. That's, in fact, a
16 codification of the existing 1901 Constitution,
17 isn't it?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. It's not a new Constitution. It's just a
20 recodification that takes out provisions that were
21 struck down, as Ms. Messick said, by the federal
22 government?

23 MS. MESSICK: Object to the form.

1 A. Yes. You're right. And -- you are
2 right. And it's my -- my understanding that it
3 was just one or so articles. It was not the
4 Constitution itself. It was an article one or two
5 or whatever that number of articles that was
6 addressed at that time. But to the Constitution
7 as a whole, issues dealing with gambling, taxes
8 and taxation, home rule, and all that, none of
9 that was addressed whatsoever.

10 Q. But the racial language that was taken
11 out in this recodification was, as she said -- as
12 Ms. Messick said, a result of rulings by the
13 federal government, by the federal courts that
14 makes them unenforceable; is that correct?

15 MS. MESSICK: Object to the form.

16 A. That's correct. In fact, that brings
17 back to my mind when you said about the federal
18 government, we talked earlier about gains and
19 losses. And the gains that we got came straight
20 from the federal government. State of Alabama
21 didn't -- hasn't passed any laws that gain for
22 minorities in this process we're saying now.

23 Q. (BY MR. BLACKSHER:) You're talking about

1 the changes that --

2 A. Right.

3 Q. -- that Mr. Walker said -- asked you
4 about that have occurred over your lifetime?

5 A. Uh-huh. I would say the positive change
6 came from the federal government, not from the
7 state. And I'll just say that simply because of
8 being a constitutional law professor, I know the
9 changes that came because I was teaching it in law
10 school, those changes. And they didn't come from
11 the state. And I was in the legislature at the
12 same time. They didn't come from us. The changes
13 and things that I saw that had happened and the
14 ones as we moved forward came from the federal
15 government.

16 Q. Did the --

17 A. And a reflection -- I just want to say
18 and a reflection of how we've gone backwards as a
19 race is that Justice Oscar Adams and Justice Cook
20 won statewide offices. We haven't had anybody,
21 especially African American, win a statewide
22 office since then. So we've gone backwards
23 really.



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING

Senator Rodger Smitherman

197..200

Page 197

1 Q. Was the opportunity you took advantage of
2 to get elected to the Alabama Senate, was that
3 opportunity provided by the federal government or
4 the state government? Did the state government or
5 the federal government provide the opportunity for
6 African Americans --

7 A. Oh.

8 Q. -- in Alabama to elect members of the
9 Alabama legislature?

10 A. I got you. No, that was federal
11 government. You know. That's where we got the
12 first opportunity after Reconstruction. It was
13 based on the federal government.

14 Q. And is the same true with respect to the
15 opportunity to elect members of Congress?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. With respect to the split of Mobile
18 County in Remedial Plan 3 that Ms. Messick was
19 asking you about --

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And didn't you testify that you support
22 this plan that was adopted by the court?

23 A. Yes. I support it. I support it now.

Page 198

1 Q. And are you aware that your lawyers in
2 court have taken the position that this plan does
3 not violate either the Voting Rights Act or the
4 Constitution?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay. Do you disagree with that?

7 A. No. Not -- not -- no. Uh-uh. Because
8 not only that, but the paramount is that we need
9 an opportunity district so African Americans at
10 least have a shot at getting the person of their
11 choice.

12 MR. BLACKSHER: Okay. Back to you,
13 Dorman.

14 Well, wait a minute. I'm sorry.

15 Ms. Sadasivan may have some questions.

16 MS. SADASIVAN: Kathryn Sadasivan. Thank
17 you so much for sitting for a deposition. I don't
18 have any further questions for the Milligan
19 plaintiffs. Thank you.

20 MR. WALKER: Nothing further for me.
21 Thank you so much for coming in today, Senator
22 Smitherman.

23 THE WITNESS: Good to see you.

Page 199

1 MR. DORMAN: Thank you.

2 MR. BLACKSHER: Okay. Off the record.

3 (The deposition was concluded at
4 12:51 p.m.)

Page 200

CERTIFICATE

1
2
3 STATE OF ALABAMA
4 AT LARGE

5
6 I hereby certify that the above and
7 foregoing deposition of SENATOR RODGER SMITHERMAN
8 was taken down by me in stenotype and the
9 questions and answers thereto were transcribed by
10 means of computer-aided transcription, and that
11 the foregoing represents a true and correct
12 transcript of the testimony given by said witness
13 upon said hearing.

14 I further certify that I am neither of
15 counsel, nor of kin to the parties to the action,
16 nor am I in anywise interested in the result of
17 said cause.

18 I further certify that I am duly licensed
19 by the Alabama Board of Court Reporting as a
20 Certified Court Reporter as evidenced by the ACCR
21 number following my name found below.

22 So certified on this date, August 22, 2024.

23
Sabrina Lewis
/s/Sabrina Lewis, CCR, RDR, CRR
CCR #165, Expires 9/30/24
Commissioner for the State of
Alabama at Large
My commission expires 5/8/27



ALABAMA
COURT REPORTING