

# EXHIBIT B

**Tuesday, January 16, 2024**

Listen to the Article

## Redistricting Commission Begins Redrawing Detroit-Area House Map

Nearly two years after it adopted maps for the House, Senate and U.S. House in 2021, the independent commission tasked with redrawing Michigan's political landscape was back at the drawing board Tuesday with a court mandate not to use race as a factor in remedy maps for new Detroit-area districts.

The commission regrouped and began mapping Tuesday to redraw House Districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 14. The districts were nullified by a federal three-judge panel as violations of the U.S. Constitution's Equal Protection Clause because the commission drastically reduced the Black voting age population in Detroit and wrapped large pieces of the city in with its surrounding and more predominantly white suburbs — done so mostly based on race, the court ruled.

While only drafts, the changes underscore the turmoil facing many incumbents in the Detroit area.

One of the versions would draw [Rep. Kimberly Edwards](#) (D-Eastpointe) and [Rep. Veronica Paiz](#) (D-Harper Woods) into the same district. Another version would create a district combining St. Clair Shores and the Grosse Pointes, where no incumbent now lives. House [Speaker Joe Tate](#) (D-Detroit), who now represents the Grosse Pointes and a chunk of Detroit, could end up with a Detroit-only district.

[Rep. Mike McFall](#) (D-Hazel Park) might lose the Detroit portion of his seat and stay north of 8 Mile Road. [Rep. Helena Scott](#) (D-Detroit) could lose the Oakland County portion of her district and stay south of 8 Mile.

Although the commission continues to fight the federal court ruling with an appeal pending before the U.S. Supreme Court, the body was not

granted a stay of enforcement from the lower court,<sup>6</sup> meaning they must start mapping to build a compliant remedy plan by February 2.

Some questioned how the commission, plagued with infighting and budget woes since the first maps were adopted in December 2021, would be able to navigate a redraw under a court order and on a truncated timeline. The last round of mapping in the Detroit area took several weeks, and some envisioned the same happening in Round 2 with three new commissioners on board following multiple resignations.

That bad blood persists (see separate story), but despite those complications, the commission on Tuesday made quick work of remapping and moved quicker in Detroit this time around. The body had nearly completed draft versions of base maps with different ideas on how to redraw the area, but the work was far from final. Various population metrics were still off across the plans and a few unassigned areas remained after a full day of mapping.

Finishing their first crack at new base maps for the House was also cut short due to several glitches with the mapping software late in the day. Metric data showed population changes in areas that went unchanged during the mapping process, leading the commission's mapping consultants, Election Data Services, to raise a white flag just before 5 p.m. to address the issues. The commission was slated to work until 6 p.m.

The last round of mapping saw the commission's staff provide shape files to members of the news media and the public savvy with mapping software. That allowed some watching the proceedings to produce maps of a given day's work.

ICRC Director Edward Woods III told Gongwer News Service that they planned to do the same this time. Tuesday's shape files, however, were not available directly after the meeting due to software errors, Woods said.

Members worked off different base maps to test different ideas, but their decisions Tuesday gave some indication on how the maps would change under each plan and which of the Detroit-area House members would be most affected.

Kent Stigall with Election Data Services suggested commissioners start at a corner or the southern portion of Detroit and move around the map in a circle to construct new districts. The 9th and the 13th House Districts were not ruled unconstitutional by the court, so they needed to stay

mostly intact. The same was true of other surrounding districts that were not included in the court's order.

Attorneys David and Nate Fink of Fink Bressack, the commission's general counsel, warned that the court was specific in its order for changes to noncompliant districts and to make few alterations in compliant areas. The commission was only allowed to make changes to other districts if they were reasonably necessary, and with a stated purpose as they continued mapping, Nate Fink said.

Stigall said that no matter how they carved up the map, changes to surrounding areas were likely inevitable even if commissioners could contain them to minor adjustments.

With those dueling considerations in mind, Commissioner Anthony Eid (I-Orchard Lake) began drawing in Royal Oak, building a new 14th District that stopped at the city line between Madison Heights and Hazel Park. That iteration carried west until it reached the western border of the current 13th District.

Commissioner Brittini Kellom (D-Detroit) drew from scratch a new 10th District comprising St. Clair Shores and moving south to encompass the entire shoreline in the Grosse Pointe area. The district resembled a skinny body double for the state of Indiana and stopped just below the eastern flank of the current 9th District.

From there, Commissioner Rhonda Lange (R-Reed City), with direction from Commissioner Rebecca Szetela, started in Eastpointe with aims to pull it into Detroit and gobble up a piece of Harper Woods. Those moves, creating a new 12th District, ate into the 13th District as Lange tried to keep Detroit's neighborhoods intact.

Commissioner Steven Lett (I-Interlochen), working off the same map, started in Ferndale and Hazel Park, grouping them together in a new 7th District. Lett's iteration stretched under the newly constructed 14th District and to the western portion of the 11th District on that draft.

Population must be their first guiding metric under the court order and the Michigan Constitution, with race no longer a factor. Many of the first few districts drawn on Tuesday had issues meeting necessary population thresholds.

Roseville was left unassigned during the first few lines, and newly selected Commissioner Marcus Muldoon (R-Lincoln Park) roped that

6  
portion into the existing 13th District – another significant boundary change to court-compliant districts.

A new 11th District formed by Chair Cynthia Orton (R-Battle Creek) attempted to bring in Detroit's Cornerstone Village and East English Village, but those changes started to gobble up portions of the current 9th District. More of downtown Detroit and its Greektown, Bricktown and Midtown areas were brought into the 11th District to balance population.

Commissioner Rebecca Szetela (I-Canton), who had a big hand in drawing Detroit's districts during the last round, moved southward to add unassigned pieces of the Downriver area to the 1st District. They were combined with Lincoln Park in consideration of the Latino community of interest there. If that were to stand, the 2nd District, now represented by [Rep. Tullio Liberati](#) (D-Allen Park), would likely need to add turf to the south to gain population. That in turn would almost surely affect [Rep. Jaime Churches](#) (D-Wyandotte), who represents one of the most competitive districts in the state.

Eid and Szetela continued to butt heads over significant changes to other districts, and the latter also had a back and forth with Nate Fink over the court order's direction regarding compliant boundary alterations.

A new 8th District was drawn by Szetela on behalf of Commissioner Erin Wagner (R-Charlotte), who has sight issues, much like she did for Lange on her turn. She started from the riverfront up to Highland Park, but the district still had population issues.

Newly selected Commissioner Donna Callaghan (D-Farmington Hills) jumped right in and built a fledgling 4th District out of pieces of the existing 5th District and some unassigned areas west of Detroit.

From there, the commission mostly shifted pieces in and out of those newly drawn districts to address population misfires.

However, Commissioner Juanita Curry (D-Detroit), who was absent from the meeting until after a midday lunch break, disliked what was done thus far. Eid helped suggest a blank slate map for Curry to work off, overlaying their latest changes in red lines to create guidelines and to avoid radical changes.

Curry's 1st District and 8th District took some from the existing 3rd District, but not much, aligning mostly with the earlier work done Tuesday. Population metrics remained low in the 4th District and the 8th

District, so the commission started roping in other outlying Detroit neighborhoods to help beef them up.

The result was a massive 8th District that several commissioners questioned, like Kellom. She suggested breaking up the 8th District into smaller chunks.

Lange also decided to go a different route, making changes to the 5th and 6th districts to combine them just south of 8 Mile Road. Her iteration had some of the 5th District moving southward and the 6th District moving north, but from a base map that already made changes to the area when other lines were adjusted. These are the extremely skinny districts that start in Birmingham and Royal Oak, respectively, and slice south into Detroit.

Most of Detroit was filled in by the late afternoon, with only a few unassigned pieces. The population metrics still needed work and the 2nd District ended up being split between changes to the 1st District.

The meeting was ultimately adjourned an hour earlier than expected due to mapping software glitches. The maps started to show population changes in districts the commission had not touched, and Stigall requested some time Tuesday evening to figure out what went wrong before allowing the commission to make additional changes.

Mapping will resume remotely at 9 a.m. on Wednesday. Members of the public can view the commission's meeting on its YouTube channel.

— By Ben Solis

[Back to top](#)

