

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

WILLIAM C. TOTH, JR., et al.,
Plaintiffs,

v.

LEIGH M. CHAPMAN, in her official
capacity as Acting Secretary of the
Commonwealth; JESSICA MATHIS, in
her official capacity as Director for the
Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services
and Notaries; and TOM WOLF, in his
official capacity as Governor of
Pennsylvania,

Defendants.

No. 1:22 Civ. 208
(Jordan, Shwartz, Wilson, JJ.)

Electronically Filed

SUMMARY JUDGMENT JOINT APPENDIX

Application for Leave to Intervene by Bryan Cutler, Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives; Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania House Of Representatives; Jake Corman, President Pro Tempore of the Pennsylvania Senate; and Kim Ward, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania Senate (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021)	A1
Expert Report of Jonathan Rodden, Ph.D. (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021)	A54

Corrected Opening Brief of House Republican Intervenors Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader, and Bryan Cutler, Speaker, of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives in Support of Proposed Congressional Redistricting Map (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A79
Report on Proposed Congressional Redistricting Plan from the Pennsylvania House Republican Caucus (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021)	A236
Responsive Expert Report of Jonathan Rodden, Ph.D. (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A287
January 27, 2022 Hearing Transcript of Proceedings before Special Master (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A299
January 28, 2022 Hearing Transcript of Proceedings before Special Master (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A971
Report Containing Special Master’s Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law Supporting Recommendation of Congressional Redistricting Plan and Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021)	A1421
Carter Petitioners’ Exceptions to the Special Master’s Report and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1649
Gressman Math/Science Petitioners’ Exceptions to Special Master’s Report and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1719
Respondents’ Exceptions Regarding the Special Master’s Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule and Incorporated Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1825
Intervenor-Respondent Governor Thomas W. Wolf’s Exceptions to the Special Master’s Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Incorporated Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1849
Exceptions of Senator Jay Costa and the Senate Democratic Caucus to the February 7, 2022 Report of the Special Master and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1975

Brief of Intervenor, Representative Joanna E. McClinton, Leader of the Democratic Caucus of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives in Support of Her Exceptions to the February 7, 2022 Report of the Special Master (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2082
Senate Republican Intervenors’ Brief in Support of Report and Recommendation of Special Master (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2119
Brief of Intervenors Bryan Cutler, Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, and Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, in Support of Judge McCullough’s Report and Recommendation (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2138
Exceptions to Special Master’s Report by Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Ryan Costello, Tom Marino, and Bud Shuster and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2201
Exceptions to Report of Special Master of Amici Khalif Ali, Maryn Formley, Richard Rafferty, Patrick Beaty, Susan Gobreski, Barbara Hill, Judy Hines, Jodi Greene, John Thompson, Cynthia Alvarado, and Timothy L. Kauffman and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2278
Exceptions of Draw the Lines PA Amicus Participants to the February 7, 2022 Report and Recommendation and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2324
Amicus Participants’ (“Citizen-Voters”) Exceptions to Report Containing Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2361
Brief of Amici Curiae Voters of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania in Support of Special Master’s Report (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2403
Brief of Amici Curiae Concerned Citizens for Democracy in Support of Petitioners (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2478
Brief for Amicus Curiae Philadelphia County Board of Elections in Support of Neither Party (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2537
Amicus Brief Submitted by Washington County Public Officials (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2548

Brief of Amicus Curiae Williamsport/Lycoming Chamber of Commerce and Greater Susquehanna Valley Chamber of Commerce Urging this Court to Adopt with One Modification the Special Master’s Report Containing Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law Supporting Recommendation of Congressional Redistricting Plan and Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule	A2556
February 23, 2022 Order Adopting Congressional Redistricting Plan, <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2599
Majority Opinion, <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2608
Concurring Opinion of Donohue, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2647
Concurring Opinion of Dougherty, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022)	A2657
Concurring Opinion of Wecht, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2662
Dissenting Opinion of Brobson, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2682
Dissenting Opinion of Mundy, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2692
Dissenting Opinion of Todd, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2713

Walter S. Zimolong III
Pennsylvania Bar No. 89151
Zimolong LLC
Post Office Box 552
Villanova, Pennsylvania 19085
(215) 665-0842
wally@zimolonglaw.com

Jonathan F. Mitchell
Pennsylvania Bar No. 91505
Mitchell Law PLLC
111 Congress Avenue, Suite 400
Austin, Texas 78701
(512) 686-3940 (phone)
(512) 686-3941 (fax)
jonathan@mitchell.law

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Michael J. Fischer* (Pa. I.D. No. 322311)
Chief Counsel and
Executive Deputy Attorney General
Aimee D. Thomson* (Pa. I.D. No. 326328)
Deputy Attorney General
PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE OF
ATTORNEY GENERAL
1600 Arch Street | Suite 300
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 560-2171
mfischer@attorneygeneral.gov

Joshua Matz*
Raymond P. Tolentino*
KAPLAN HECKER & FINK LLP
1050 K Street NW | Suite 1040
Washington, DC 20001
(929) 294-2537
jmatz@kaplanhecker.com
rtolentino@kaplanhecker.com

Christine P. Sun*
Marina Eisner*
STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY
CENTER
1101 17th Street NW
Washington, DC 20036
(240) 600-1316
christine@statesuniteddemocracy.org
marina@statesuniteddemocracy.org

Robert A. Wiygul (Pa. I.D. No. 310760)
Cary L. Rice* (Pa. I.D. No. 325227)
John B. Hill* (Pa. I.D. No. 328340)
HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL
PUDLIN & SCHILLER
One Logan Square, 27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 568-6200
rwiygul@hangley.com

Counsel for Defendants

**Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

Abha Khanna*
Elias Law Group LLP
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100
Seattle, WA 98101
akhanna@elias.law
T: (206) 656-0177

Lalitha D. Madduri*
Jyoti Jasrasaria*
Christina Ford*
Joseph Posimato*
Tina Meng*
Elias Law Group LLP
10 G St. NE, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20002
lmadduri@elias.law
jjasrasaria@elias.law
tmeng@elias.law
T: (202) 968-4490

Matthew Gordon*
Perkins Coie LLP
1201 Third Avenue Suite 4900
Seattle, WA 98101
MGordon@perkinscoie.com
T: (206) 359-3552

Timothy D. Katsiff (PA 75490)
Edward D. Rogers (PA 69337)*
Marcel S. Pratt (PA 307483)*
Robert J. Clark (PA 308105)*
Michael R. McDonald (PA 326873)*
Paul K. Ort (PA 326044)
Ballard Spahr LLP
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
KatsiffT@ballardspahr.com
RogersE@ballardspahr.com
PrattM@ballardspahr.com
ClarkR@ballardspahr.com
McDonaldM@ballardspahr.com
OrtP@ballardspahr.com
T: (215) 665-8500
F: (215) 864-8999

Counsel for Carter Intervenors

**Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 25th day of March 2022, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served upon all counsel of record via the court's CM/ECF electronic filing system.

Dated: March 25, 2022

/s/ John B. Hill
John B. Hill